ORIGINAL

RECEIVED-FPSC 00 APR -7 PH 1:36

Legal Department

NANCY B. WHITE General Counsel-Florida

BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. 150 South Monroe Street **Room 400** Tallahassee, Florida 32301 (305) 347-5558

RECORDS AND REPORTING

April 7, 2000

Mrs. Blanca S. Bayó Director, Division of Records and Reporting Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

#### Docket No. 000121-TP (OSS) Re:

Dear Ms. Bayó:

Enclosed is an original and 15 copies of BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.'s Supplementary Comments, which we ask that you file in the captioned matter.

A copy of this letter is enclosed. Please mark it to indicate that the original was filed and return the copy to me. Copies have been served to the parties shown on the attached Certificate of Service.

Sincerely,

Nancy B. White (FW)

Enclosures

APP CAF CMU 🛓

CTR EAG

LEG

MAS OPC

FRR SEC

WAW OTH

cc: All parties of record Marshall M. Criser, III R. Douglas Lackey

RECEIVED & FILED

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE

04330 APR-78

FPSC-RECORDS/PEPORTING

ORIGINAL.

### BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In re: Investigation into the ) Establishment of Operations Support ) Systems Permanent Performance ) Measures for Incumbent Local Exchange) Telecommunications Companies ) Docket No. 000121-TP

Filed: April 7, 2000

## BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.'S SUPPLEMENTARY COMMENTS

BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. ("BellSouth"), pursuant to the notice given by the Staff of the Florida Public Service Commission ("Commission") at the workshop held on March 30, 2000 in the above captioned matter, hereby files its Supplementary Comments. In support thereof, BellSouth states the following:

### A. <u>Authority</u>

The Commission has the authority to set performance standards on any local exchange company on the level of wholesale service that that local exchange company provides through its Operations Support Systems. The Commission has the authority to require incumbents ("ILECs"), as well as alternate local exchange companies ("ALECs"), to report results on performance standards. Requiring periodic reporting by ALECs will ensure that the Commission has full and complete information on the service provided to the end user. The Commission does not have authority to award damages to an ALEC or an ILEC for non-compliance with performance standards.

BellSouth has entered into interconnection agreements that include performance standards and penalties. These are freely negotiated agreements available to an

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE 04330 APR-78 FPSC-RECORDS/REPORTING interconnector. This Commission, however, does not have authority to order performance standards harsher than those contained in the negotiated agreements. The Commission has consistently recognized that it does not have authority under state law to award damages to a third party.

All ILECs and ALECs should be subjected to a set of performance standards that compare the service provided to wholesale customers to the service provided to retail customers. Of necessity, there may be differences in those standards due to the procedures and the interfaces specific to a certain company, but there must be consistency in key measurements and related standards.

The ultimate result of this proceeding may be rulemaking or a Commission order. The rulemaking process should not be used, however, to avoid previous Commission decisions on damages. A rule for wholesale standards should work in the same manner as on the retail side. In order to impose a penalty, a show cause proceeding would be required, with the penalty payment going to the state general fund, not as a windfall to an ALEC.

2

# B. Administrative

Performance measures should be established in a short a timeframe as possible. This is not a proceeding that should be delayed. BellSouth suggests that the Staff conduct an independent assessment, allow for comments by parties and prepare a recommendation for Commission approval. This proceeding should apply to all ILECs. BellSouth should not be singled out for special treatment.

# C. Establishment of Standards

Performance Measurements are intended to allow the Commission to monitor

service the ILEC provides to its retail customers and to the ALECs and to detect

disparate treatment. The question before the Florida Public Service Commission is

'How many measurements are required to detect disparity and what product and

geographic detail is appropriate?'

There are several points of reference:

1. BellSouth currently provides 52 separate reports, many of which contain multiple measurements. This is approximately 3 times the number of measurements used by the Department of Justice in its recent evaluation of Bell Atlantic's application for In-Region InterLATA services.

2. In the FCC's Notice of Proposed Rule Making, (CC Docket 98-56, Paragraph 36), the FCC stated that the 'requirement for performance measurements should balance the goal of detecting discrimination with the goal of minimizing the burden imposed on the incumbent local exchange carrier.'

The Commission should focus on several key, customer oriented, outcome measurements and avoid those submetrics that measure fractions of an overall process. This will make periodic reviews and analysis much more efficient. Several ALECs will advocate more measurements, more product and geographic disaggregation. The Commission should understand that the ALECs have a <u>very</u> strong financial incentive to argue for more test points for penalties, particularly when there is no offset for superior service provided to the ALEC.

The Florida Public Service Commission has the experience in evaluating Performance Measurements that few Commissions have prior to ruling on the measurements applicable for their state. The Commission has received reports for over one year and has been directing the process to establish interim measurements for the OSS Evaluation. Based on that experience, the Commission can determine if the thousands of numbers produced each month are adequate.

#### D. Monitoring Performance Standards

. . .

BellSouth anticipates that a review of Performance Measurements will be a time consuming process. Consequently the Commission should conduct biannual reviews. However, once the Performance Measurements and Standards are initially established, the Commission should conduct a review of the standards after 6 months.

4

There was a significant amount of discussion at the March 30, 2000 workshop over Item D-3: Should an ILEC have to meet each individual standard in order to be viewed in compliance?

There is a considerable amount of precedence on this issue. The Commission has years of experience in regulating the telecommunications industry. Compliance with service rules, rates of return and prices has rarely, if ever, been a determinate of one discrete result. The Commission has considered a suite of results over the long term to determine compliance. The same principles should apply in determining parity of service. To do otherwise would imply that the customer served by an ALEC has considerably more oversight than the same customer served by the ILEC.

#### E. Penalties for Noncompliance

. . . - -

A rulemaking proceeding should apply to all local exchange companies and should ensure comparable treatment for wholesale and retail service. As discussed above, it would be inappropriate to allow the ALECs to enrich themselves or obtain a windfall or to use penalties as a line of business. This would not stimulate competition. There is a procedure in place to handle non-compliance with a Commission rule. Penalty payments are not awarded to a third party; they inure to the state. Therefore, penalties may be appropriate depending on who receives the payment.

5

Respectfully submitted this 7th day of April, 2000.

BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC.

nac D. White NANCY B. WHITE BW

MICHAEL P. GOGGIN c/o Nancy H. Sims 150 So. Monroe Street, Suite 400 Tallahassee, FL 32301 (305) 347-5555

1.1 Key R. DOUGLAS LACKEY

R. DOUGLAS LACKEY Suite 4300 675 W. Peachtree St., NE Atlanta, GA 30375 (404) 335-0747

204498

. . . . . .

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE Docket No. 000121-TP

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served via

U.S. Mail this 7th day of April, 2000 to the following:

Timothy Vaccaro Staff Counsel Florida Public Service Commission Division of Legal Services 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

AT&T Marsha Rule 101 North Monroe Street Suite 700 Tallahassee, FL 32301-1549 Tel. No. (850) 425-6365 Fax. No. (850) 425-6361

GTE Florida, Inc. Kimberly Caswell P.O. Box 110, FLTC0007 Tampa, FL 33601-0110 Tel. No. (813) 483-2617 Fax. No. (813) 223-4888

Nanette Edwards Regulatory Attorney ITC^DeltaCom 4092 S. Memorial Parkway Huntsville, Alabama 35802 Tel. No. (256) 382-3856 Fax. No. (256) 382-3936 Scott A. Sapperstein Intermedia Communications, Inc. 3625 Queen Palm Drive Tampa, Florida 33619 Tel. No. (813) 829-4093 Fax. No. (813) 349-9802

Charles J. Pellegrini Wiggins & Villacorta, P.A. 2145 Delta Boulevard Suite 200 Post Office Drawer 1657 Tallahassee, FL 32302 Tel. No. (850) 358-6007 Fax. No. (850) 358-6008 Counsel for Intermedia

Peter M. Dunbar, Esquire Karen M. Camechis, Esquire Pennington, Moore, Wilkinson, Bell & Dunbar, P.A. Post Office Box 10095 (32302) 215 South Monroe Street, 2nd Floor Tallahassee, FL 32301

Nancy B. White (A)