Rose, Sundstrom & Bentley, LLP

RIGINAL

2548 Blairstone Pines Drive Tallahassee, Florida 32301

(850) 877-6555 Fax (850) 656-4029 www.rsbattorneys.com

**REPLY TO ALTAMONTE SPRINGS** 

## November 10, 2003

<u>Central Florida Office</u> 600 S. North Lake Blvd., Suite 160 Altamonte Springs, Florda 32701 (407) 830-6331 Fax (407) 830-8522

MARTIN S. FRIEDMAN, P.A. VALERIE L. LORD, OF COUNSEL (LICENSED IN TEXAS ONLY)

Ms. Blanca Bayo Commission Clerk and Administrative Services Director Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard Tallahassee, FL 32399

Re: Application of Island Environmental Utility, Inc., for Original Certificate Docket No.: 020745-SU <u>Our File No.: 37025.01</u>

Dear Ms. Bayo:

Enclosed please find for filing in the above-referenced docket the original and seven (7) copies of Island Environmental Utility, Inc.'s, Motion to Compel Discovery served on Linda Bamfield.

yours Very *t*ruly

VALERIE L. LORD Of Counsel

AUS CAF CMP COM VLL/lm CTR Enclosures ECR GCL OPC cc: MMS SEC OTH

cc: Rosanne Gervasi, Esquire (w/enclosure) Mr. Daniel Nolan (w/enclosure) Mrs. Linda Bamfield (w/enclosure) Mr. Ronald Koenig (w/enclosure) Mr. John R. Boyer (w/enclosure) Mr. Dean Beckstead (w/enclosure) 03 NOV 12 AM 9: 03

DOCUMENT NUMBER-DATE

1245 NOV 128

**FPSC-COMMISSION CLERK** 

CHRIS H. BENTLEY, P.A. ROBERT C. BRANNAN DAVID F. CHESTER F. MARSHALL DETERDING JOHN R. JENKINS, P.A. STEVEN T. MINDLIN, P.A. DAREN L. SHIPPY WILLIAM E. SUNDSTROM, P.A. DIANE D. TREMOR, P.A. JOHN L. WHARTON ROBERT M. C. ROSE, OF COUNSEL WAYNE L. SCHIEFELBEIN, OF COUNSEL

## **BEFORE THE FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION**

IN RE: Application for certificate to provide wastewater service in Charlotte County, Florida by Island Environmental Utility, Inc. **Docket No. 020745-SU** 

## **MOTION TO COMPEL DISCOVERY**

Island Environmental Utility, Inc. (hereinafter "*Island Environmental*"), by and through its undersigned attorney, requests that the Florida Public Service Commission (hereinafter "*Commission*") compel Linda B. Bamfield (hereinafter "*Ms. Bamfield*") to answer Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents served on her by Island Environmental in this proceeding (hereinafter "*Discovery*"), and shows:

- 1. Island Environmental served Discovery on Ms. Bamfield on October 30, 2003.
- 2. Ms. Bamfield sent a copy of her Objections to Discovery on November 6, 2003.
- 3. Ms. Bamfield's Objections can be broken down into four categories:
  - (A) The "relevant questions" contained in the Discovery that will be addressed in her testimony scheduled to be filed on November 14, 2003;
  - (B) The Discovery to which she refuses to respond because she believes is not related to this matter;
  - (C) The Discovery that she considers "intrusive, objectionable and serve no purpose other than to harass, embarrass and annoy"; and
  - (D) The Discovery that she considers "irrelevant, immaterial and are not calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence."

4. Ms. Bamfield has not specified the specific Discovery to which she is objecting. In addition, she has utterly failed to specify which Discovery she considers unrelated to this matter.

Island Environmental is entitled to know the specific Discovery to which Ms. Bamfield is objecting, | | 245 NOV 128 and the specific grounds for her objections.

5. Ms. Bamfield has failed to specify what information *she* considers "relevant" and will be addressed in her testimony. It is this Commission's right and duty to determine what is relevant and what is not relevant to this matter. Ms. Bamfield is testing the mandate of this Commission by attempting to usurp its statutorily delegated authority.

6. Rule 1.280(b)(1), Fla. R. Civ. P., specifically provides that parties may obtain discovery "regarding any matter, not privileged, that is relevant to the subject matter of the action". Island Environmental carefully considered the Discovery propounded to Ms. Bamfield. The Discovery requests information that Island Environmental requires to accurately and completely address the issues Ms. Bamfield raises in her objections to the Application pending before this Commission.

7. Ms. Bamfield has objected to certain Discovery on the grounds that it is not calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. Rule 1.280(b)(1), Fla. R. Civ. P., provides that it is not grounds for objection that "the information sought will be inadmissible at the trial if the information sought appears reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence." The standard is "*appears reasonably calculated* to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence," not the standard she is asserting, that of admissibility at the trial. Ms. Bamfield does not understand the difference between the two standards.

8. Ms. Bamfield failed to specify which Discovery she considers "intrusive and objectionable". She has not claimed that the information requested is privileged or confidential, or requested a protective Order on a showing of good cause as provided by Rule 1.280(c), Fla. R. Civ. P.

2

9. Rule 1.340(a), Fla. R. Civ. P., requires a party to answer each interrogatory separately and fully in writing under oath unless it objected to, and if a party objects to an interrogatory, the grounds for objection shall be stated. Rule 1.350(b), Fla. R. Civ. P., relating to Requests for Production of Documents contains similar provisions. Ms. Bamfield has not answered any Discovery to which she has not objected, nor has she stated the grounds for objecting to any of the Discovery to which she has objected, as required by the cited Rules.

10. Island Environmental requires answers to the Discovery propounded to Ms. Bamfield in order to give it a fair and reasonable opportunity to assess the nature and extent of Ms. Bamfield's claims and to respond to Ms. Bamfield's objections to the Application. Ms. Bamfield's refusal to answer the Discovery has prevented Island Environmental from investigating Ms. Bamfield's objections to the Application, assessing the impact of its proposed territory extension on Ms. Bamfield's interests, preparing a defense to her objections or structuring reasonable alternatives, all to its detriment.

11. Island Environmental requests an Order compelling Ms. Bamfield to fully and completely answer the Discovery, as required by the Florida Rules of Civil Procedure.

Respectfully submitted on this \_\_\_\_\_, day of November, 2003.

Rose, Sundstrom & Bentley, LLP 600 S. North Lake Boulevard, Suite 160 Altamonte Springs, Florida 32701 Telephone: (407) 830-6331 Facsimile: (407) 830-8522 Email: mfriedman@rsbattorneys.com

All to - Vinille

Martin S. Friedman, Esq.

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE DOCKET NO. 020745-SU

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing Motion to Compel

Discovery has been furnished by U.S. Mail to the following parties on this \_\_\_\_\_ day of

November, 2003:

Mr. Daniel Nolan 3031 Placida Road Englewood, FL 34224

and at

156 Bayview Avenue POB 23 S 4 Port McNicoll, Canada L0K 1RO

Mr. Ronald Koenig 8006 Lago Vista Drive Tampa, FL 33614

Mrs. Linda Bamfield P.O. Box 5063 Grove City, FL 34224

Rosanne Gervasi, Esquire Office of General Counsel Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard Tallahassee, FL 32399-0850

leviten

Martin S. Friedman, Esq.

C:\Documents and Settings\orlando\My Documents\1 ALTAMONTE\ISLAND ENVIRONMENTAL\Motion to Compel (Bamfield).wpd