BEFORE THE

FLORIDA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

DOCKET NO. 060635-EU

In the Matter of

PETITION FOR DETERMINATION OF NEED FOR

ELECTRICAL POWER PLANT IN TAYLOR COUNTY

BY FLORIDA MUNICIPAL POWER AGENCY, JEA,

REEDY CREEK IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT, AND

CITY OF TALLAHASSEE.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_/

VOLUME 2

Pages 111 through 204

ELECTRONIC VERSIONS OF THIS TRANSCRIPT ARE

A CONVENIENCE COPY ONLY AND ARE NOT

THE OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT OF THE HEARING,

THE .PDF VERSION INCLUDES PREFILED TESTIMONY.

PROCEEDINGS: HEARING

BEFORE: CHAIRMAN LISA POLAK EDGAR

COMMISSIONER ISILIO ARRIAGA

COMMISSIONER MATTHEW M. CARTER, II

COMMISSIONER KATRINA J. TEW

COMMISSIONER KENNETH W. LITTLEFIELD

DATE: Wednesday, January 10, 2007

TIME: Commenced at 1:54 p.m.

Concluded at 3:59 p.m.

PLACE: Betty Easley Conference Center

Room 148

4075 Esplanade Way

Tallahassee, Florida

REPORTED BY: LORI DEZELL, RPR, CCR

APPEARANCES: (As heretofore noted.)

112

I N D E X

WITNESSES

NAME: PAGE NO.

LAD DANIELS

Direct Statement 116

IRENE PARKER

Direct Statement 125

RAY BELLAMY, M.D.

Direct Statement 126

JOHN DICKERT

Direct Statement 132

GALE DICKERT

Direct Statement 135

CAROLE TAITT

Direct Statement 150

RICK BREER

Direct Statement 155

JANET MONROE

Direct Statement 158

LYNN REYNOLDS

Direct Statement 163

DORIS KELYNACK

Direct Statement 168

113

POLLY PERKINS

Direct Statement 176

BETTY JOHNSON

Direct Statement 178

DIANE WHITFIELD

Direct Statement 190

PAM McVETY

Direct Statement 199

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER 203

114

EXHIBITS

NUMBER: ADMTD.

88 Comments of Mr. Miller 114

89 Documents submitted by Ms. Dickert 149

90 Comments of Mr. Dickert 156

91 Comments of Ms. Taitt 156

92 Documents submitted by Ms. Reynolds 166

93 Comments of Ms. Byne 167

94 Comments of Ms. Kelynack 175

95 Comments of Ms. Perkins 189

96 Comments of Ms. Johnson 189

97 Documents submitted by Ms. Whitfield 198

98 Documents submitted by Ms. McVety 202

115

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 (Transcript follows in sequence from

3 Volume 2.)

4 COMMISSIONER LITTLEFIELD: Good afternoon. We

5 are going to come back from lunch break and go back

6 on the record. And I'm going to begin by turning

7 to Ms. Brubaker.

8 And where are we and where do we go next?

9 MS. BRUBAKER: Yes. During the break, I was

10 approached by a customer who had originally signed

11 up to speak, Mr. Kent Miller, and he has asked in

12 light of especially the time frame we have

13 currently, in lieu of his public testimony, if he

14 could simply submit a document to be identified.

15 And we have provided that to the commissioners and

16 to the parties. And unless there's an objection, I

17 would suggest we do so.

18 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Seeing no objection, we will

19 enter that document -- or excuse me, we will mark

20 that document as No. 88.

21 (Exhibit No. 88 admitted into the record.)

22 MS. BRUBAKER: I've also been asked to let the

23 audience in general know that we have a lost memory

24 stick in case anybody is missing one.

25 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: If so, please come and speak

116

1 to our legal staff.

2 MS. BRUBAKER: And with that, unless there's

3 another matter to be addressed, we're ready to

4 resume public testimony.

5 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Okay. Who is next on the

6 list?

7 MS. BRUBAKER: Let's go ahead and start with

8 Lad Daniels. And the next speakers will be

9 Irene Parker, Ray Bellamy and John Dickert.

10 LAD DANIELS

11 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

12 testified as follows:

13 DIRECT STATEMENT

14 MR. DANIELS: Good afternoon, Madam Chairman,

15 Commissioners. I come before you today wearing two

16 hats. The first hat that I'm wearing is as

17 president of the First Coast Manufacturers

18 Association and a member of the board of directors

19 of the Manufacturers Association of Florida, and

20 the second hat that I'm wearing is I'm representing

21 myself individually as a member of the city council

22 for the City of Jacksonville.

23 So I'm wearing one hat as an elected official

24 and another as a representative of a trade

25 association. And I think the essence of what we're

117

1 talking about here today, and I'm speaking in

2 support of the construction of the power plant, the

3 800 megawatt power plant, in essence what we're

4 wrestling with as a state and you as a commission

5 is how do we handle growth and growth management.

6 We deal with that in our public arena every day.

7 Let me speak first as a representative of the

8 manufacturers here in this state, some 15,000

9 companies representing some 400,000 employees whose

10 basic tenant is really in the context here to

11 improve the economy and protect the environment.

12 And I've heard a number of comments since I've

13 been here regarding concerns about the environment,

14 and I just would like to go on the record of saying

15 the companies that I represent share that same

16 concern. First and foremost, we're interested in

17 protecting our community, and mainly because our

18 employees live in those communities, and we're as

19 concerned with what happens in those communities as

20 anyone else.

21 Our concerns, of course, are affordable power,

22 reliable sources of energy. The unique feature of

23 the manufacturing community that I think causes me

24 to come before you today is the fact that if we

25 look at the cost of goods sold for typical

118

1 manufacturers, our energy costs runs somewhere

2 between 15 and 18 percent of cost of goods sold.

3 So it's a huge component in terms of how we are

4 able to compete effectively. That translates

5 directly back to the affordability, reliability

6 issue.

7 It's no -- it's no secret that the

8 manufacturing community as relates to power usage

9 not only do we have a high percentage of our cost

10 of goods sold directly related to energy, but we're

11 typically some of the biggest customers that

12 utility companies have. And that has forced a

13 partnership between the two groups that, I think,

14 has worked to the betterment of us as a total

15 community and as a state. And there has been some

16 significant progress that have been made both in

17 conservation areas, both for electricity and

18 water/sewer.

19 We operate in an extremely competitive

20 environment. In the context of what you are

21 dealing with today, our competitive environment we

22 could talk about the global nature of that

23 environment or the regional nature of that -- of

24 that competition that we face. But I think in this

25 context, we need to talk about the competitive

119

1 environment we -- we deal with in dealing with our

2 next-door neighbors.

3 So we find particularly as across the northern

4 part of Florida, we're dealing with what's

5 happening in power and power usage and power

6 consumption and rates and reliability with Georgia

7 and Alabama. So we benchmark against those. So we

8 would encourage you to look favorably upon the

9 addition of this power plant.

10 Let me take off my hat for manufacturing and

11 put on the public policy hat as an elected

12 official. And here I'm speaking individually. I

13 wish I could tell you I was speaking for the entire

14 City of Jacksonville and all the city council, but

15 I won't expose my 19 other colleagues to that.

16 We have the same concern as elected officials

17 that you have. We are very, very concerned about

18 public policy, particularly as it relates to

19 energy, energy usage and the impact that it's going

20 to have on us as citizens and our constituents.

21 Yet we find ourselves aligned with looking for

22 affordable, reliable sources of energy. We're very

23 concerned about diversifying sources.

24 We -- we know that we've got to look at all

25 types of alternatives and -- and types of energy

120

1 generation in the future that we had not seen fit

2 to take a look at in the recent past. And I think

3 in terms of nuclear energy as an example.

4 The creativity that I see coming forth in

5 the -- from the utility companies and from their

6 customers in terms of developing alternative

7 sources of energy, I find encouraging. And I sense

8 that there is a shift in the political winds to

9 become more realistic in how we look at some

10 alternatives.

11 I think that offshore power generation or

12 offshore drilling becomes an issue that we are

13 beginning to wrestle with here as a state in a way

14 that we were not willing to acknowledge in the

15 recent past. And I think that's good as we look at

16 ethanol, as we look at biomass, as we look at all

17 of these other ways of looking at alternative

18 sources of fuel.

19 I think you're -- my experience is we're

20 finding elected officials as representatives of

21 their constituents are much more receptive to the

22 ideas of what we can do to continue to provide a

23 reliable and affordable sources of energy for our

24 consumers in the state.

25 And I look at it, as I wrap up my context, I

121

1 look at this as almost an environmental stewardship

2 issue as we look at it. And as we wrestle with the

3 fact that we've got a thousand people a day coming

4 into Florida. They're going to continue to come to

5 us. We have got to figure out some way to manage

6 growth. And as a part of that, we have got to

7 figure out how we're going to provide sources of

8 energy at a reliable and affordable basis for these

9 consumers. So I find as I wear that public hat

10 very much in sympathy with what you're going

11 through. I'm glad you're sitting there and I'm not

12 joining you. But we are seeing that same issue

13 being played out locally with us.

14 The interesting thing that I share with you on

15 our community is we're finding that our local

16 municipal utility, JEA, has become a leader in

17 technical innovation. I think that will play out

18 to a positive impact here with what you're looking

19 at with this application.

20 We find that they are extremely good

21 environmental stewards. And we find that they also

22 have initiated and have been successful in creating

23 a strong partnership with their customer base --

24 and there I put back on the manufacturer's hat --

25 but also their consumer base at large. And I would

122

1 think that that would work to the betterment of us

2 as a state.

3 In conclusion, both wearing that public hat as

4 an individual and that other hat as representing

5 the manufacturing community, we would encourage the

6 support of this power plant. And I'm available for

7 any questions that you may have.

8 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Mr. Daniels.

9 Questions? Commissioner Littlefield.

10 COMMISSIONER LITTLEFIELD: Thank you,

11 Madam Chair.

12 Just to clear up in my mind, when you had

13 started your presentation you had said something

14 about manufacturing being the largest or one of the

15 largest users of energy in the state?

16 MR. DANIELS: Our members, manufacturers in

17 the state, tend to be big consumers of energy. So

18 as customers of utility companies, our guys spend a

19 lot of money, use a lot of the energy.

20 COMMISSIONER LITTLEFIELD: Okay. I

21 misunderstood that statement. I thought you were

22 saying that manufacturers were the largest user of

23 energy in the state.

24 MR. DANIELS: No, sir.

25 COMMISSIONER LITTLEFIELD: And then I wanted

123

1 to pursue what percentage was the residential

2 customers.

3 MR. DANIELS: I can't speak to that.

4 COMMISSIONER LITTLEFIELD: Thank you,

5 Madam Chair.

6 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Mr. Arriaga?

7 COMMISSIONER ARRIAGA: You're absolutely

8 right. JEA happens to be the forefront of

9 technological advancement. I admire your company.

10 It is a magnificent company. Because of that

11 technological knowledge, did JEA consider other

12 possibilities such as IGCC, any other type of plant

13 besides this one?

14 MR. DANIELS: I'm not representing JEA. So I

15 can't --

16 COMMISSIONER ARRIAGA: I know, the --

17 MR. DANIELS: I can't speak to that. I would

18 let them speak to that one. Wearing my public hat

19 as a member of the city council, JEA presents that

20 capital budget to us for approval on an annual

21 basis. We leave it to them to evaluate the choices

22 of how they're going to provide energy to us.

23 COMMISSIONER ARRIAGA: The JEA recommended to

24 the council this specific plant?

25 MR. DANIELS: JEA has only come to the council

124

1 to ask for funding for the capital program. And

2 didn't ask for a definition from us or approval

3 from us of the type of energy.

4 COMMISSIONER ARRIAGA: Has the city council

5 approved?

6 MR. DANIELS: We've approved the capital

7 budget. We've not asked -- we've not been asked to

8 approve the specific type of power plant.

9 COMMISSIONER ARRIAGA: You approved the budget

10 that includes investment in this plant?

11 MR. DANIELS: Yes, sir.

12 COMMISSIONER ARRIAGA: Okay. Thank you.

13 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Mr. Perko?

14 MR. PERKO: Just one clarifying question,

15 Ms. Chairman.

16 Just so I understand it, the JEA board decides

17 upon the integrated resource plant; is that

18 correct?

19 MR. DANIELS: Correct.

20 MR. PERKO: Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Councilman.

22 MR. DANIELS: Thank you, Madam Chair.

23 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Ms. Brubaker?

24 MS. BRUBAKER: Irene Parker.

25 IRENE PARKER

125

1 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

2 testified as follows:

3 DIRECT STATEMENT

4 MS. PARKER: I'm from Taylor County. I'm

5 100 percent against the coal plant. We haven't

6 been promised anything except that they want to put

7 lines down to run the juice thisaway, thataway, the

8 other way. We have children. We have about three

9 ladies out there in the audience that has worked

10 getting doctors and getting professionals to come

11 into meetings and tell us about the things that we

12 can dread in 20 years if we get it, or ten years.

13 Our children. Doctors that have told us even

14 pregnant women can bring a child into this world

15 with a defective brain. There's four generations

16 where I live. Me, my children, my grandchildren

17 and my great grandchildren that's coming along.

18 And there's many families in Taylor County like

19 that.

20 We still have children in school now that --

21 in the elementary school, sometimes I work out

22 there, I see aides pushing that child because he

23 can't walk or that girl. And then there's even

24 little blind children. And this was before the

25 coal plant even come up. But then that's bad.

126

1 But what we are going to get is going to be

2 much, much, much worse. And we don't want it. And

3 there's a whole lot of people in Taylor County that

4 don't want it. That's it.

5 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, ma'am.

6 Ms. Brubaker?

7 MS. BRUBAKER: Ray Bellamy.

8 RAY BELLAMY, M.D.

9 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

10 testified as follows:

11 DIRECT STATEMENT

12 DR. BELLAMY: Well, that's a difficult act to

13 follow. Ray Bellamy. I've been a Tallahassee

14 physician for over 30 years.

15 Let me clear up a couple of misconceptions,

16 Commissioner Littlefield. In reference to the high

17 particulate levels in this area and affecting the

18 mortality rates and so on, the last I checked, the

19 average Tallahasseean moved every 3.2 years. And

20 so we're in a mobile society. And to see the

21 health effects of living in one area over many

22 years, it's not that easy.

23 In addition, overall health and mortality

24 rates are very much related to a whole bunch of

25 factors like socioeconomic class and so on. And as

127

1 you know in Leon County, every other person is an

2 attorney. And, you know, there's a different --

3 there's a different population here. So that the

4 connection between death rates here and

5 particulates is not that easy to pin down.

6 There were -- there were comments made by

7 Mayor Marks on the high electric utility rates here

8 in this area. As I understand it -- my late wife

9 used to be mayor of Tallahassee. And as I

10 understand it, because there's so much property on

11 the -- which is not subject to property taxes, the

12 City of Tallahassee has elected to have high

13 electric utility rates to capture revenue from that

14 source. And I -- as I understand it, it's about

15 16 percent of their operating revenue from selling

16 power. And so it's -- that is more of a factor in

17 the high utility rates here than the cost of

18 natural gas.

19 Let me -- I'll -- I would second the health

20 effects concerns mentioned by Dr. Saff and I think

21 health effects and environmental effects definitely

22 have economic impacts just -- I feel the same way

23 Dr. Saff does on that. And I'll come back to the

24 environment in just a second.

25 As previously mentioned, the Florida Medical

128

1 Association, the Georgia Medical Association, the

2 Capital Medical Society have all taken position

3 statements against this coal plant. Many of the

4 surrounding counties around Taylor County -- you

5 heard from the Baker County commissioner. You

6 heard from the individual from Madison County who

7 are concerned about rail traffic. Wakulla County,

8 I've talked to their commissioners. And they're,

9 as I understand it, very much against this. And

10 certainly Madison County is.

11 The New York Times -- let's talk about a

12 300-pound gorilla here in the room. The New York

13 Times had a front page photo Saturday of a young

14 woman in Central Park in short sleeves -- this is

15 in January -- pushing her kids on a swing.

16 Yesterday an official declaration was made that

17 2006 was the warmest year on record.

18 I think everyone in this room agrees that

19 carbon capture mandates are right around the

20 corner. Every expert I've talked to says within

21 two or three years -- Barbara Boxer is now chairman

22 of that committee in the Senate as I understand it,

23 and has made it clear she's going to have hearings

24 on that soon.

25 If you shove the carbon cost matter aside and

129

1 say that's to be dealt with by DEP, as I understand

2 it, they have no current official rules on carbon.

3 And so that basically says we ignore that entire

4 gorilla in this room.

5 It's a huge impending cost factor. And as

6 testimony previously addressed, the cost of this

7 pulverized coal plant because of its effect, as I

8 understand it, the amount of carbon will be emitted

9 per year that 600,000 automobiles would emit in

10 that year. Now, this is for the next 50 years. So

11 when you -- if you include carbon costs in this

12 equation, this is -- this is not a wise decision.

13 Let me read a bit of a letter by the director

14 of the Center for Health and the Global Environment

15 at Harvard Medical School which was written

16 January 2nd of this year. Do we know for certain

17 when and how much Greenland and the West Antarctic

18 ice sheet will melt with global warming and the

19 exact amount the sea level will rise as a result or

20 how intense heat waves, droughts, floods and storms

21 will become? The answer is no.

22 It is not possible to make exact predictions

23 about such complex systems. But there is no

24 uncertainty among the world's leading scientists,

25 that if we do not significantly reduce our current

130

1 levels of burning fossil fuels, our world will

2 experience profound changes, many of them

3 irreversible in its physical, chemical and

4 biological composition. And there's absolutely no

5 question that these changes will severely threaten

6 life, including human life on this planet. It

7 would be shamefully ignorant and morally

8 inexcusable, not unconscionable, Commissioner

9 Carter, but morally inexcusable, if we did not do

10 everything in our power to prevent these changes

11 from occurring.

12 Political leaders, policymakers and the public

13 should not be misled by the few scientists who

14 persistently emphasize the uncertainties of climate

15 science as if these uncertainties guaranteed that

16 global warming consequences would not be

17 catastrophic. And this is Dr. Sheviain (phonetic)

18 who is director of the Center for Health and the

19 Global Environment at Harvard Medical School.

20 Now, I'll wrap up here with just a few phrases

21 from the abstract of the report by the Union of

22 Concerned Scientists on gambling with coal. First

23 sentence, "New conventional coal plants are an

24 imprudent financial investment." A later sentence,

25 "Laws requiring coal plants to pay to emit carbon

131

1 dioxide will be adopted in the next few years

2 substantially raising the cost of coal power."

3 Later, "Utility managers and shareholders

4 should reconsider the financial risk to their

5 companies and customers. Regulators should prevent

6 utilities from making these major investment

7 mistakes by refusing to approve the construction of

8 new conventional coal plants and by requiring them

9 to invest in cleaner alternatives or at the very

10 least by warning utilities that CO2 costs must be

11 borne by their shareholders, not by ratepayers."

12 I think this is information you cannot ignore

13 in your position as decision-makers. Thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Dr. Bellamy.

15 Commissioner Carter?

16 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Dr. Bellamy, good to see

17 you again. I don't know if you remember that I

18 worked on Carol's campaign. She was a fantastic

19 person. One of the best mayors in the history of

20 the City of Tallahassee. And it was a tremendous

21 loss. I see you still have the fire and look

22 forward to having all of your comments put into the

23 record. Good to see you again and thank you for

24 your service to this community.

25 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Seeing no questions, thank

132

1 you, Dr. Bellamy.

2 MS. BRUBAKER: Just for clarification,

3 Mr. Bellamy, did you intend to incorporate your

4 documents into the record or are your verbal

5 comments sufficient?

6 DR. BELLAMY: They're sufficient.

7 MS. BRUBAKER: Thank you.

8 Next speaker is John Dickert, followed by

9 Gale Dickert, Carole Taitt and Rick Breer.

10 JOHN DICKERT

11 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

12 testified as follows:

13 DIRECT STATEMENT

14 MR. DICKERT: My name is John Dickert. I live

15 at 411 Plantation Road, Perry, Florida. Our home

16 is only about 3 miles from the proposed power plant

17 and the paper mill. Also we own 20 acres of

18 timberland which is within 500 feet of the proposed

19 site. We are opposed to the power plant.

20 Back in the 1960s, I received my master's

21 degree in mechanical engineering and my

22 professional license. Recently I completed a

23 course in clean energy technologies. The

24 information that you received from Mr. Richard

25 Furman is correct. The IGCC power plant is the

133

1 best available technology. It is more efficient

2 and 50 to 90 percent cleaner. As Mr. Furman

3 pointed out, IGCC power plants can provide lower

4 electric costs than pulverized coal plants.

5 Last week Florida's DEP advised the Governor

6 to implement a carbon emissions tax here in Florida

7 within three years if the federal government does

8 not implement one. Today, no one is capable of

9 saying what the cost of electricity from the Taylor

10 Energy Center will be when the carbon tax is

11 implemented. How can a need for a power plant be

12 determined if you don't know the cost?

13 In Taylor County, we do not need this power

14 plant because the citizens do not get any of the

15 power generated, just the pollution and a few jobs.

16 In Tallahassee, experts have advised the city

17 that they could serve more than 160 megawatts by an

18 efficiency and conservation program. And the city

19 has already implemented the program. Tallahassee

20 does not need this power plant and we do not need

21 it in our region.

22 We have a duplex apartment in Tallahassee, and

23 the tenants have complained about the cost of

24 electric utilities. As taxpayers, we do not want

25 to see Tallahassee get obligated for paying for a

134

1 huge power plant that they do not need.

2 The coalition of owners of the Taylor Energy

3 Center include cities from Jacksonville to Key

4 West. Have all of these cities implemented demand

5 side management programs like Tallahassee? It

6 seems reasonable that the Public Service Commission

7 ask for their reports on their conservation

8 programs.

9 The demand side should be addressed before

10 building another power plant. The real problem

11 with locating a power plant in Taylor County is the

12 paper mill. It emits too much pollution already.

13 My wife coughs all night when there is an inversion

14 and the wind blows smoke on us from the paper mill.

15 You don't need to add the pollution of a

16 coal-fired power plant on top of the pollution from

17 this paper mill. The combination of the two would

18 be more polluting that any one single coal-fired

19 power plant in the state of Florida. Please deny

20 the request. Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Mr. Dickert.

22 Questions? Thank you.

23 MS. BRUBAKER: Gale Dickert?

24 GALE DICKERT

25 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

135

1 testified as follows:

2 DIRECT STATEMENT

3 MS. DICKERT: Commissioners, I thank you for

4 allowing us to speak today.

5 I live at 411 Plantation Road, Perry, Florida.

6 For the past 25 years, I have dedicated my life to

7 improving the lives of young people in our county,

8 developing programs like Boys and Girls Club that

9 target low income families. I have been a teacher

10 and I know what it's like to see the children with

11 impairments.

12 We will talk about the mercury this plant will

13 produce. It's important for you to know that the

14 Buckeye plant puts out more lead than any plant in

15 the state that impairs the neurological system.

16 And coupled with the mercury, it would be a

17 devastating problem and the other pollution. All

18 of it goes together. It's not one thing. It's a

19 lot of things that break the camel's back.

20 I have very deep concerns and I'm very

21 worried. We live in a paper mill town with many

22 problems related to pollution. We have a high rate

23 of cancer. The mill has been there 54 years. It

24 takes a long time to begin to see effects and we're

25 seeing them. Many in my neighborhood have cancer.

136

1 It has touched almost every single family. Some

2 very deeply.

3 Asthma is a serious problem with our children.

4 My grandchildren and my own children have had

5 asthma. I have asthma. And the other night when

6 we had a low ceiling, whenever you-all were

7 enjoying the nice rain that we need so much, when

8 it comes down on us and we're inundated with

9 sulfureous fumes that just -- it's every breath you

10 take.

11 So Saturday night, John and I -- Saturday

12 afternoon, John and I said we'll go to Tallahassee

13 and get out of the bad weather. And we'll -- the

14 bad smell, and we'll do something and we'll come

15 back. When we came back, it was even worse.

16 Now, we're very fortunate. John's father

17 40 something years ago built a tiny cottage down in

18 Steinhatchee. When we got home, I said it was so

19 bad, I said to John, we'll just throw our things in

20 the car and we'll go straight on down there and

21 spend the night.

22 As I went over that Fenholloway River, it was

23 just steaming with pollution. I thought about my

24 kids, our families, and there are so many. They

25 don't have any recourse. They can't leave. Some

137

1 who live close to the plant do not have air

2 conditioning.

3 It's unbelievable. It's every breath you

4 breathe when it's like that. You're breathing in

5 toxins that are affecting your body. I ask each

6 one of you up there today on that panel to please,

7 please get a list, Florida PURG has a list of the

8 effects of coal plant pollution and the same

9 pollutants are in the paper mill.

10 So when you have the two together, you are

11 literally doubling or tripling the pollutants. And

12 my husband is an engineer. He can tell you that

13 it's more than just two plants. When you put them

14 right together like that, there's a multiplier in

15 there, is the way John put it. There's a

16 multiplier in there, when it's coming from the same

17 direction.

18 And other companies that have wanted to come

19 in like Seminole a few years ago said they couldn't

20 put it in that quadrant of the county not only

21 because there's not enough water, but because it

22 wouldn't be the right thing to put two big plants

23 like that right together on the people, the effect

24 is too great.

25 Okay. The people are literally trapped in

138

1 pollution with no escape. The people in

2 Taylor County whenever it's bad. You don't smell

3 it as bad every day. And you get so -- when it's

4 just -- a lot of times you think you can't smell

5 it. But someone will visit you and they will say,

6 what is that terrible smell? It's sort of like

7 when you put lotion or perfume on and you get so

8 you can't smell it. Anyway, but it's there; it's

9 always there.

10 You can imagine my reaction when I learned

11 that our county commission had without informing

12 the public and with no public hearing one night

13 without it being on the agenda invited JEA to build

14 a coal plant next to the paper mill. And by the

15 time we had our next commission meeting, they had

16 already sent a written invitation. Now, is that

17 right?

18 And now we hear they want to put more than one

19 plant. They've admitted that. On 32 acres they

20 could put coal plants from now to kingdom come.

21 What do we do? Do we declare Taylor County a

22 wasted county? Are we expendable?

23 John and I could afford to move. You don't

24 really want to move. You have roots and you don't

25 want to move away from your home.

139

1 But the kids that I've worked with all of

2 those years, they don't have anywhere to go. When

3 we started working with them with the Boys and

4 Girls Club, they hadn't been to the beach. It's

5 18 miles away. A lot of them. They hadn't been

6 anywhere, a lot of them. And they won't go

7 anywhere. They'll stay there and they'll die in

8 it.

9 And we're faced now with looking at the

10 prospect of 50 to 60 years more of life-robbing

11 pollution. I know the Duval Medical Society has

12 taken a tough stand. And I know they want to come

13 to our area, because I don't think they'd let them

14 put a plant of this magnitude and this polluting,

15 additional one in Jacksonville.

16 And they talked about what good stewards they

17 are. I want you to know that their plants -- and I

18 know you know this, that their plants, their north

19 side and their power park plants over in

20 Jacksonville had the highest mercury emissions in

21 the state of Florida. And that was reported in

22 September 13th, '05 in the Times Union.

23 Also, they're having a problem now. They're

24 being sued because of the problems they had

25 20 years ago with the chemical spill that they

140

1 didn't take care of properly. And the people

2 should have been asked to move or something in the

3 neighborhood. And now they're dying of cancer.

4 And they came and testified in our county about

5 that. Teresa Maskell was the person who testified.

6 And so that's a serious problem.

7 We've packed the County commission chambers

8 all year. I haven't had a lot of time in the past

9 two years for my children's programs, hardly at

10 all, because I have learned everything I can about

11 power plants. I aim to protect our kids and our

12 families. That is important to me. I didn't spend

13 my life trying to protect them and help them have a

14 chance in life for nothing. Not for this. Not for

15 this.

16 When we -- our county commissioners who always

17 have been warm and wonderful to me and to the --

18 you can notice the people who are here, some of

19 them, like our social worker from the school, he

20 feels the same way I do. We haven't been treated

21 kindly.

22 You see, in a paper mill town, the paper mill

23 controls everything. And so whenever we've gone

24 and talked about our rights to clean air and water,

25 that we too have the right to breathe clean air in

141

1 Taylor County like you-all want to breathe clean

2 air, we were faced with icy stares and boredom

3 because they knew, they had already -- the powers

4 that be had told them you have to be for this

5 plant. We begged for a vote.

6 A couple of years before, they tried to bring

7 a missile range in. We begged for a vote then and

8 we got it. They knew not to give us a vote. We

9 voted 76 percent against the missile range. We

10 didn't get a vote. Although they got one in

11 Tallahassee.

12 The people of Taylor County, we haven't had a

13 choice. We don't have a choice. And for months on

14 end, JEA has conducted a heavy expensive -- you're

15 talking about expense. Expensive campaign of false

16 promises often using outrageous or wellion

17 (phonetic) type ads like this one. And I gave you

18 copies of these.

19 This one chose beautiful pine lands with one

20 of our little ponds. And it says, "Generating

21 solutions to help us all breathe better." Is that

22 acceptable, I ask you? Is that acceptable to fool

23 a population and to mislead people and to use -- to

24 use visual aids like this to fool them?

25 Or this one that says, "Generating career

142

1 opportunities that protect our way of life." When

2 you're bringing thousands more tons of pollutants a

3 year in, and to say your slogan, "Powering the

4 economy, protecting the environment," when you're

5 going to add thousands and millions of tons more

6 carbon but hundreds -- thousands more tons of

7 sulfur dioxide, nitrogen dioxide and particulate

8 matter, mercury to the environment.

9 They aren't telling the truth. Are they

10 telling the truth to you? We know they are not

11 telling the truth when they say it's the best

12 available technology. It's the cleanest. Because

13 Mr. Furman told you and we all know because we can

14 read and we can read, and it tell -- we've

15 researched it and we know that it's not the

16 cleanest and state-of-the-art and best available.

17 I believe this is immoral. It's immoral when it

18 has to do with hurting children and with hurting

19 people and hurting their health.

20 In this ad right here, they show a black

21 child. This one made me cry. We know that our

22 African-American people in this country are most at

23 risk of coal plant pollution and the illnesses and

24 the bad effects it causes. Bryant Gumbel did a

25 great show on that about the little town of

143

1 Cheshire, Ohio. This is not acceptable.

2 In their ads and their graphs they put in

3 Perry's papers and in this brochure, which I'll be

4 glad to leave with you, on all their graphs, they

5 do not put mercury showing emissions. They don't

6 put mercury and they don't put CO2 emissions. They

7 don't show them. That is not right.

8 A Tallahassee study shows that it doesn't have

9 to be this way. As a matter of fact, I believe

10 that Tallahassee study which I followed carefully

11 with the Big Bend Climate Action Team's report show

12 they could really get the power that they need

13 without this coal plant at all.

14 Our state has been called ground zero for

15 global warming. I plead -- I plead with you to

16 require those 28 other cities wanting power to do

17 an unbiased assessment of cleaner energy options

18 and to implement them just as Tallahassee has done.

19 You know, in California, they were able to save

20 5,000 megawatts to prevent the rolling brown-outs

21 whenever they just required all the people to put

22 in the compact flourescent lights and to put in LED

23 streetlights, into exit signs and things like that.

24 Simple things. Simple things.

25 Those cities in this consortium who still

144

1 insist on pulverized coal should be willing to put

2 it in their cities, cities far away from us like

3 Key West and Marathon and Melbourne and places like

4 that. They're putting all their pollution on us

5 while they receive the power. Let them put the

6 pulverized plants in their own town.

7 Our 20 acres that John spoke about a minute

8 ago that sits within 500 feet of the proposed plant

9 site was a part of my past. It's a -- it was my

10 grandmother's -- it was part of my grandmother's

11 farm near the Fenholloway River. Almost right on

12 it. I swam in that Fenholloway River and we got

13 our drinking water from it. That was before

14 Buckeye. That was before 54 years ago.

15 Spending summers with her with no electricity,

16 no electricity, and no running water and depending

17 on a wood stove and oil lamps taught me lessons

18 everyone should learn about conservation. Living

19 in a clean environment that was not polluted until

20 I was 14 years old made me realize that clean air

21 and water is worth fighting for. Without it, we

22 all perish.

23 Will we be like the little town -- will be we

24 like that little town in Cheshire, Ohio where the

25 children and the towns people were so sickened by

145

1 the coal plant that the utility ended up buying out

2 the town for $20 million? JEA's coal plant beside

3 the paper mill would equal a similar situation to

4 that in Cheshire. And when they add more and

5 more coal plants, the place will be uninhabitable.

6 It almost is now on many days, believe me. I live

7 with my inhaler beside me. Or will we be wiser?

8 Mr. Furman has told you the truth. I ask that

9 you deny the request of this coal consortium

10 please, and I thank you.

11 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Mrs. Dickert.

12 Commissioner Littlefield.

13 COMMISSIONER LITTLEFIELD: Thank you, Madam

14 Chair.

15 Thank you for being here today. I've always

16 appreciated a passion and recognize it when I see

17 it.

18 MS. DICKERT: Thank you, sir.

19 COMMISSIONER LITTLEFIELD: I certainly

20 emphasize with you. Growing up in Pascagoula,

21 Mississippi, a paper mill there, Poage plant,

22 coupled with that a Puss-N-Boots cat food factory.

23 And certainly when the inversion came and the

24 ceiling got very low, it was -- you could cut it

25 almost with a knife. And I understand where you're

146

1 coming from with that.

2 But you made a statement that a lot of your

3 friends, families that you associate with, they

4 have been touched by cancer. Is there a high --

5 higher percentage of cancer victims where you live

6 there in Taylor County than there is in the rest of

7 Florida?

8 MS. DICKERT: We've been told by people in the

9 hospital that we have a very high rate of COPD and

10 lung cancer. There's a high rate of lung cancer

11 and COPD. People who worked for the -- that worked

12 on drives for the American Lung Association and

13 groups like that comment on it. And I know that

14 we -- we have a problem with the children with

15 asthma, more of a problem.

16 And, you know, I haven't done a study myself,

17 but they have -- they did -- we asked -- I went to

18 the Legislature last spring and -- the energy

19 commission in the meetings on energy in the Senate

20 and the House, and I asked them if they would do an

21 Ellen Brockovich type door-to-door health study

22 before siting a power plant in the state. I felt

23 that was critically important. That that's so

24 important to find out how many people are already

25 sick from present pollution. Because it's not like

147

1 they're going to put this power plant in a place

2 that isn't already terribly polluted.

3 And -- and Senator Margolis was very

4 interested. As a matter of fact, some DEP people

5 were there that morning. And she said, you know,

6 would you do an ambient air study for these people?

7 And I thought, you know, we really need a

8 door-to-door. We need a real -- a real

9 epidemiological study done by epidemiologists.

10 Something that's done by an impartial group, not

11 the power plant.

12 And they -- they have gotten the -- the JEA

13 group has asked -- somehow they got together with

14 the people with the development authority there in

15 Perry, so gung-ho over the power plant, and after I

16 went to the house and maybe they planned it before,

17 but they decided they would do something called a

18 health risk assessment. It's just ridiculous.

19 They don't consider the impact of Buckeye at

20 all, the paper mill at all in it. I don't know

21 what they consider. They just come up with some

22 pie in the sky thing, that they'll get some

23 statistics from the health department. And they --

24 I don't know what they do. But it's ridiculous.

25 It's not at all what I had in mind and it's not at

148

1 all what is needed.

2 If they put these plants in a place where it

3 was totally isolated, that might be one thing. But

4 this is right on top of our small population.

5 We're a very small town. There's 20,000 in the

6 county. 10,000 people in the town of Perry and the

7 city. We have 600 kids in our school who -- that's

8 an alarming number of children that are impaired --

9 considered impaired. And that was, that was

10 printed last -- that was in some publication, a

11 teacher had written that to the newspaper because

12 they were so alarmed. 600 children already that

13 are impaired.

14 So there needs to be a real study. There

15 needs to be a real study done. And I think that

16 the least they could do is to use the IGCC

17 technology which is so much cleaner. It's so much

18 cleaner with the sulfur. They admitted recently

19 that they're higher with the sulfur than the IGCC.

20 And they told us all during the year when we

21 asked way back months ago how much mercury that

22 would be emitted, and they said 30 -- 300 pounds a

23 year. And we went -- we attended JEA meetings that

24 were held in conjunction with the NRDC this year

25 and we brought that up again and again.

149

1 300 pounds? It would be 300 pounds? Yes, yes.

2 They concurred that was the amount.

3 Well, lately we're hearing it's this much

4 smaller amount. Well, they didn't change the

5 technology. I mean, why all of a sudden is it so

6 much less?

7 I don't know. I just worry about the

8 truthfulness of all of this. And I think that we

9 need to do a lot more thinking about this. I think

10 this isn't something you just do. You know, you

11 don't just go and put it in in Perry because Perry

12 is a place you can forget about and the people are

13 expendable.

14 And I thank you, sir, for mentioning that you

15 understand. Because it's so hard for people to

16 understand. I told John Saturday I wish I could

17 bottle some of this and take it with me on

18 Wednesday.

19 COMMISSIONER LITTLEFIELD: I'm glad you

20 didn't.

21 MS. DICKERT: One friend said if we only had a

22 scratch test and we could send it out. You know,

23 put sulfur dioxide on the scratch thing. And they

24 said, well, you can't put that through the mail.

25 So...

150

1 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Mrs. Dickert, thank you.

2 MS. DICKERT: Thank you.

3 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Mrs. Brubaker, we have two

4 documents that Mrs. Dickert shared with us. So we

5 need to mark those.

6 MS. BRUBAKER: That's correct. And it will be

7 No. 89 by my count.

8 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: 89, thank you.

9 (Exhibit No. 89 admitted into the record.)

10 MS. BRUBAKER: Next speaker is Carole Taitt.

11 CAROLE TAITT

12 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

13 testified as follows:

14 DIRECT STATEMENT

15 MS. TAITT: Good afternoon. My name is

16 Carole Taitt, spelled T-A-I-T-T. I live in Perry,

17 Florida. And this hearing is not about the needs

18 of Taylor County but about the needs or the wants

19 of a corporation to make profits on electricity.

20 Projected needs for the growth of not the

21 state but specified targeted areas. The wants of

22 TEC, JEA are north Florida's waters, cheaper labor

23 and untaxed land at reasonable prices. The needs

24 of TEC were to put the rose colored glassed on the

25 TCDA and our county commissioners and convince them

151

1 that their wants were my county's needs.

2 Our county will not get any of this power.

3 Florida ranks third in the producing of fish and

4 other seafoods. When the oceans absorb carbon

5 dioxide, it reacts with seawater to form carbonic

6 acid. Ocean acidification, as this phenomenon is

7 called, over time will create major negative

8 impacts on corals and other marine life with

9 anticipated adverse consequences for fishing,

10 tourism and other related economies.

11 Aquiculture ranks in the top three moneymaker

12 producers in the counties of Franklin, Gulf and

13 Liberty which surround the -- up in the Gulf area.

14 Taylor County's top three crops are timber, cattle

15 and hay. And Leon County's top crops are timber,

16 vegetables, cattle and dairy.

17 Agriculture is an important national economic

18 engine. Last year Florida was fourth in the state

19 in net farm income. And in cash receipts, it was

20 ranked fifth, well above all national averages.

21 The economy of this area is founded on the

22 harvesting of pine, cattle, clams, oysters and

23 other fishing industries. The impact of

24 destruction on these industries for generations

25 have supplied food for families, restaurants, other

152

1 related businesses not only in Taylor County but

2 throughout the state and the country.

3 Economy is not based on the need for

4 electricity. It is based on the renewable sources

5 of an area. And once they are gone, the area is

6 dead. We are the first capital of the south and

7 sulfur dioxide or SO2 can damage pines, especially

8 in the growing season. And from what I've read,

9 there are impacts on the citrus crops throughout

10 the state also from some of these plants.

11 And according to -- according to an impact

12 study done by the North-Central Florida Regional

13 Planning Council for the Taylor County Development

14 Authority, the ratio of new residents and

15 unemployment will rise in the county after the

16 construction phase is over.

17 The plant may meet current emissions as they

18 state in your issue 6, but to have a must-start

19 date of 2012 implies to me that TEC wants the plant

20 up and operational before 2012 when new laws are

21 supposed to go into effect and affect their

22 production of electricity.

23 Economically unsound advice is to put all of

24 your eggs in one basket. And policy 2.3 of the TEC

25 amendment states, "Energy from coal-fired plants is

153

1 very profitable, but putting all the emphasis on

2 coal is a risky business."

3 In a PCS -- PSC report that I read stated that

4 by 2014 more gas-fired plants would be in use.

5 Supporting a coal-fired plant would be -- well,

6 supporting a coal-fired plant will be obsolete

7 before it sends its first surge of energy over the

8 wire.

9 I am not a proponent of IGCC, but because IGCC

10 needs to sequester its carbon and move it, mercury

11 will not go up the stacks. However, under our

12 area, Taylor County and along the coastal area,

13 there's only 100 feet of lime rock that the aquifer

14 runs through. And this is the thinnest layer of

15 rock bed in the state along our coasts. Along the

16 other coasts in south Florida, it is much, much

17 thicker. So if they wanted to sequester carbon, I

18 don't think they could. It would wind up in our

19 water.

20 Building more power plants does not make much

21 sense environmentally or economically. The 2005

22 Florida Statutes, Chapter 403, Part 1,

23 environmental control, Section 403.021, legislative

24 declaration, public policy 403.021(1)(1) states,

25 "The pollution of the air and waters of this state

154

1 constitutes a menace to public health and welfare,

2 creates public nuisances. It's harmful to wildlife

3 and fish and other aquatic life and impairs

4 domestic, agricultural, industrial, recreational

5 and other beneficial uses of air and water." And

6 all three sections of this statute repeatedly

7 enforced the need for clean air and water.

8 The national action plan for energy efficiency

9 dated July 2006 states, "Well-designed energy

10 efficiency programs can provide opportunities for

11 customers of all types to adopt energy saving

12 measures that can improve their comfort and level

13 of service while reducing their energy bills.

14 Well-designed energy efficiency programs are saving

15 energy at an average cost of about half of the

16 typical cost of a new plant."

17 Pepco Energy is supplying wind energy to the

18 National Geographic Society's office in Washington,

19 D.C. And as Christopher Lidell, the National

20 Geographic's executive vice president and chief

21 financial officer stated, "Thanks to energy saving

22 initiatives implemented since 2001, the society is

23 now using 2.7 million kilowatt hours less per year

24 than five years ago." Also using this wind power

25 is the EPA in Washington, Lady Liberty and the

155

1 Ellis Island museum.

2 As the late Edmond S. Musley said, "We impose

3 the cost of pollution on people who breathe so the

4 people who pollute can avoid the cost of control."

5 And he thinks that is backwards.

6 Thank you very much for your time.

7 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Ms. Taitt.

8 Ms. Brubaker?

9 MS. BRUBAKER: Rick Breer.

10 RICK BREER

11 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

12 testified as follows:

13 DIRECT STATEMENT

14 MR. BREER: Madam Chair, Commissioners, thank

15 you very much for the chance to speak.

16 Commissioners, the cancer rate, lung cancer

17 rate, in Taylor County is higher than the

18 surrounding -- than other -- than the state

19 average. But it's interesting, if you go look at

20 rural counties as a whole, whether they had a

21 Buckeye in their past or not, those rates are also

22 above the state average.

23 My name is Rick Breer. I am the director of

24 economic development in Taylor County. And so you

25 see I have a professional interest in TEC coming to

156

1 fruition. But I'm not here today as the -- as the

2 director of economic development.

3 You've heard a lot of environmental

4 information passed on to you today that is not

5 pertinent to this hearing. And my job as the

6 director economic development would be to share

7 with you the financial impact data that TEC would

8 bring to our county. That also is not pertinent to

9 the hearing here today. And so I'm here as a

10 private citizen. A very selfish private citizen.

11 My wife who is way too good looking to be with

12 me had -- is a long time heavy smoker. She has

13 done permanent damage to herself. She uses a

14 nebulizer at least a half a dozen times a day. She

15 uses an oxygen machine all night long. Both of

16 those are fired by electricity.

17 We have had during hurricane season up to five

18 or six days without electricity at our place. We,

19 like previous folks who gave testimony, are

20 fortunate enough to be in a position where we could

21 go solve the problem somewhere else and provide her

22 with the electricity she needed for -- to

23 facilitate her breathing.

24 So if -- if this plant being constructed

25 lessens the possibility of California like problems

157

1 here in Florida, then my wife and I are in favor.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, sir.

4 MS. BRUBAKER: Before we call the next

5 speaker, just a quick question. We've received

6 transcribed -- basically transcriptions of the

7 comments provided by Mr. and Mrs. Dickert and also

8 Ms. Taitt. Are they still present in the room?

9 Just for clarification, did you also intend to

10 submit these into the record? Your comments are

11 part of the record. Do you also wish to have this

12 submitted as an exhibit?

13 Okay. Are the Dickerts also still present?

14 Is it also your intention, sir, to have this --

15 okay.

16 If we can then have the Dickerts' comments

17 identified as Exhibit 90 and Ms. Taitt's comments

18 identified as 91, please.

19 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: So marked.

20 (Exhibits No. 90 and 91 admitted into the

21 record.)

22 MS. BRUBAKER: Thank you. And with that, the

23 next speakers listed are Janet Monroe. Is

24 Lynn Reynolds present? She has signed up. She has

25 not indicated whether nor not she wishes to speak.

158

1 You do wish to speak?

2 Okay. So it will be Janet Monroe,

3 Lynn Reynolds and then Doris -- excuse me if I

4 mispronounce this -- Kelynack?

5 MS. KELYNACK: Kelynack.

6 MS. BRUBAKER: Thank you.

7 JANET MONROE

8 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

9 testified as follows:

10 DIRECT STATEMENT

11 MS. MONROE: Good afternoon. My name is

12 Janet Monroe. I'm a Taylor County resident. First

13 of all, I wanted to start off by bringing your

14 attention to five of the 25 specifics goals and

15 policies that are stated in our state comprehensive

16 plan. I'm just going to hit a little bit on the

17 five.

18 Health. The goal is listed as, "healthy

19 residents who protect their own health and the

20 health of others and who actively participate in

21 recovering their own health when they become ill."

22 Goal No. 2, "An environment which supports a

23 healthy population and which does not cause

24 illness. Every Florida resident has a right to

25 breathe clean air, drink pure water and eat

159

1 nutritious food." This goal is presently being

2 violated in Taylor County by the Buckeye pulp mill.

3 "Government shall ensure that future growth

4 does not cause the environment to adversely affect

5 the health of the population." Allowing Taylor

6 Energy Center will be doing just that.

7 We have talked to them regarding pulverized

8 versus gasification. And it seems to me that the

9 reason why they do not allow the gasification which

10 they have stated is because it costs too much money

11 to build that kind of a plant. And they were not

12 willing to offset that by charging more for

13 their -- to their customers. Well, I think that

14 our health and our livelihood and our children's

15 future and the future of the residents of

16 Taylor County is worth more than that.

17 Anyway, No. 10 for air quality. "Improve air

18 quality and maintenance" -- excuse me. "Improve

19 air quality and maintain the improved level to

20 safeguard human health and prevent damage to the

21 natural environment."

22 It also states, "Reduce sulfur dioxide and

23 nitrogen oxide emissions and their effects on the

24 natural and human environment." It also states,

25 "Encourage the use of alternative energy resources

160

1 that do not degrade air quality. Ensure at a

2 minimum that power plant fuel conversion does not

3 result in higher levels of pollution."

4 Regarding energy. "The gulf state Florida

5 shall reduce its energy requirements through

6 enhanced conservation and efficiency measures in

7 all end use sectors while at the same time

8 promoting an increased use of renewable energy

9 resources."

10 It also states, "Reduce the need for new power

11 plants by encouraging end use efficiency, reducing

12 peak demand and using cost-effective alternatives."

13 It states, "Promote the development and application

14 of solar energy technologies and passive solar

15 design techniques. Promote the use and development

16 of renewable energy resources."

17 Regarding employment. The goal states,

18 "Florida shall promote economic opportunities for

19 its unemployed and economically disadvantaged

20 residents."

21 Yes, Taylor County needs jobs. That is a

22 fact. But if you look at the industries that we

23 already have in Taylor County, three major

24 employers are either big polluters or very

25 dangerous. Buckeye pulpwood mill is just horrible.

161

1 And like Ms. Gale was saying, there are times where

2 you cannot breathe. The stench is just

3 unbelievable.

4 And then to add on top of that, the

5 smokestacks that are going to come from this

6 coal-burning power plant on top of the pollution

7 that we already have, it's just unthinkable. It

8 just blows my mind to think that people are

9 actually wanting this in the county, some people.

10 The ones that are going to profit from it. But the

11 residents are not going to profit anything. We are

12 going to get the pollution, the health risks, the

13 illnesses.

14 Martin Electronics employs a lot of people out

15 there. That's a bomb plant. And we also have

16 three -- three Florida State prisons. I work at

17 one of them. These are all dangerous. They all

18 have effects on your health. We don't need another

19 major health effect employer.

20 No. 25, plan implementation. The goal states,

21 "Systematic planning capabilities shall be

22 integrated into all levels of government in Florida

23 with particular emphasis on improving

24 intergovernmental coordination and maximizing

25 citizen involvement; encourage citizen

162

1 participation at all levels of policy development,

2 planning and operations; to encourage the continual

3 cooperation among communities which have a unique

4 natural area respective of political boundaries to

5 bring the private and public sectors together for

6 establishing an orderly, environmentally and

7 economically sound plan for future needs and

8 growth."

9 In conclusion, according to the Florida State

10 comprehensive plan, allowing JEA to build this

11 pulverized coal-burning power plant would result in

12 direct violation of our state comprehensive plan.

13 Thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Ms. Monroe,

15 appreciate your comments.

16 Ms. Brubaker?

17 MS. BRUBAKER: Do we have written comments

18 from Ms. Monroe?

19 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: I don't think so.

20 MS. BRUBAKER: That's all right. It's in the

21 record. I want to make sure I don't miss anybody.

22 Lynn Reynolds is the next speaker. Just to

23 help keep us straight, if someone does wish to

24 submit comments, please make sure that's clear

25 before you leave the stand. I'd appreciate it.

163

1 Thank you.

2 LYNN REYNOLDS

3 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

4 testified as follows:

5 DIRECT STATEMENT

6 MS. REYNOLDS: I do have some comments that I

7 will give to you.

8 My name is Lynn Reynolds. I am a resident of

9 Taylor County as well as an educator in

10 Taylor County. And I appreciate the opportunity to

11 speak to you because I can see that you are

12 listening and I appreciate that very much.

13 I am asking you to wait on a decision to

14 approve the need for the building of a 800 megawatt

15 pulverized coal plant in Taylor County. That's one

16 of the biggest ones there is. Please give your

17 decision time to evaluate conservation and

18 efficiency savings in each community to be served.

19 Please look at demand side management of each

20 utility applicant.

21 In addition, I'm asking you to compare the

22 cost of developing and using clean renewable energy

23 sources that are in line with the state

24 comprehensive plan for health. Compared to that of

25 using old polluting resources that degrade the

164

1 quality of air and water resources.

2 I'm here today to say that I don't think

3 there's a need for the power plant to come to

4 Taylor County. And I am going to present a

5 statistical brief found from our own Florida

6 Department of Education. And the date is

7 January 2007. It's a statistical brief which shows

8 the membership in Florida's public schools. And it

9 states that Florida's pre-K to 12 student

10 membership is showing a statewide decline for the

11 first time in more than two decades. And that

12 suggests that the population growth patterns in

13 Florida are changing.

14 I was given a list of the 29 communities

15 served by the Florida Municipal Power Agency, many

16 of them, probably half, have shown a decrease in

17 enrollment. Fewer students can mean fewer families

18 and schools as customers needing power.

19 Examples are Duval County, where Jacksonville

20 Beach is, down by 1,364 students. Monroe County,

21 which includes Key West, down by 212. Miami-Dade

22 County, which includes Homestead, is down by 8,250

23 students. Alachua County, which includes

24 Gainesville and Newberry, is down 108 students.

25 Bradford County, which includes Stark, is down

165

1 96 students. Palm Beach County, which includes

2 Lake Worth, is down 3,482 students. Calhoun

3 County, which includes Blountstown, is down

4 47 students. Other significant areas to be served

5 are Seminole County, which is down 1,124 students

6 and Orange County is down 152 students.

7 I'm also presenting articles that were written

8 by Orlando Sentinel. This is dated December 22nd.

9 This is after a Florida census report was given.

10 Headline, Florida growth goes from wild to mild.

11 Population experts point to economic factors that

12 are cooling the Sunshine State's appeal.

13 I also have an article from the Tampa Tribune.

14 They all relate that the boom for the Sunshine

15 State has slowed. In the Tampa Tribune it is

16 written that school officials projected 2.7 million

17 students but were short more than 48,000. It said

18 that most counties saw enrollment growth stop.

19 Demographers such as William Frye from the

20 Brookings Institution in Washington, D.C. and other

21 experts have theorized that because of the property

22 prices increasing in Florida, the price of homes

23 and cost of premium insurance is getting too

24 expensive for families with children.

25 It is also written in these reports that

166

1 Florida has slipped from fourth to ninth on the

2 list of fast growing states. So I think we're

3 starting to see a change.

4 Finally, as a teacher and educator, I'm asking

5 you to evaluate the inevitable cost to the schools

6 in Taylor County. Increased emissions and air

7 pollution will bring an increase of student

8 absenteeism because of asthma attacks. And this

9 affects me greatly. I have about five in my

10 classroom who have severe asthma.

11 Please remember that as students miss school

12 due to illness, parents miss work also. That

13 creates an additional hardship on the community.

14 Like the snowball effect, where one thing leads to

15 another, the whole education system will be at

16 risk. Teachers will become overburdened with

17 trying to help students to make up missed work and

18 to meet the state standards for excellent schools.

19 Some of the children may develop neurological

20 disorders and special needs because of increased

21 levels of mercury produced by pulverized coal

22 plants. The county school system will then be

23 burdened with trying to meet their special needs

24 and to meet the state standards for education.

25 My question is: Who is prepared to pay for

167

1 the increased cost to the school system and

2 prepared -- is Taylor County -- or Taylor Energy

3 Center going to pass the extra cost onto their

4 customers, or will the taxpayers, and I'm one of

5 them, be asked to pick up the tab? I appreciate

6 your listening.

7 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Ms. Reynolds. And

8 you do have some documents that you want to give to

9 our staff?

10 MS. REYNOLDS: Yes, I do.

11 MS. BRUBAKER: And that will be item 92. If I

12 may before the next speaker comes up, we have

13 received subsequent to her testimony some

14 additional documents for Ms. Gale Dickert that was

15 Item 9. It was the brochure that she had held up

16 and demonstrated, and also just a written summary

17 of comments. Unless there's an objection from the

18 parties, I would ask that that also be included as

19 part of exhibit identified as No. 89.

20 (Exhibit No. 92 admitted into the record.)

21 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Yes. That works for you,

22 that works for me.

23 MS. BRUBAKER: We have also received comments

24 from a Ms. Catherine Byne who apparently in lieu of

25 speaking would prefer to submit comments as an

168

1 exhibit. We have copies. We're happy to provide

2 them to the parties. But if it's acceptable to the

3 parties, we'd simply like to have that identified

4 as an exhibit also. If that is acceptable, it will

5 be Exhibit No. 93.

6 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: I'm seeing no objection. We

7 will mark that as Exhibit 93.

8 (Exhibit No. 93 admitted into the record.)

9 MS. BRUBAKER: Thank you. I'll see that that

10 gets distributed to the parties. Thank you.

11 With that, the next speaker is Doris Kelynack.

12 MS. KELYNACK: Kelynack.

13 MS. BRUBAKER: Thank you. My apologies.

14 DORIS KELYNACK

15 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

16 testified as follows:

17 DIRECT STATEMENT

18 MS. KELYNACK: The Y is an I. Had an English

19 husband and he wouldn't let anybody call us

20 Kelynack. I look like I've been run over by a coal

21 train, but I'm legally blind. I usually have my

22 sister to help me. Let me see if I can see what

23 I've written here.

24 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Ma'am, before you start, can

25 you spell your name for us, please.

169

1 MS. KELYNACK: K-E-L-Y-N-A-C-K. And as a

2 child when they taught the vowels, the teacher used

3 to say A, E, I, O, U and sometimes Y, I thought

4 that's stupid. And when I got to be -- after my

5 first husband died and I married the Englishman, I

6 found out why.

7 Anyway, I've -- this is usually my nap time.

8 My name is Doris Kelynack. I have lived or been a

9 resident of Perry for 85 years. Sunday, my

10 preacher saw me at church and he said, how are you

11 today? I said, don't ask an 85-year-old woman how

12 she is because I might have told him I felt like

13 hell.

14 Okay. Enough fun. I'm a Depression child,

15 lived in the '30s when we were taught early not to

16 want for something we didn't need, and

17 Taylor County doesn't need the coal plant.

18 Everybody has told you that, except the ones here

19 on the other side.

20 And the reason we have so many elderly today,

21 the others, the men, have connections with Buckeye

22 or they're in business and they want to make more

23 money, so they're leaving it to the women just like

24 the speaker of the house. Every time I go to

25 Hardee's, we get kidded about the woman speaker.

170

1 Well, they better look out. They might have a

2 woman president.

3 Anyway, women, old women like a lot of us

4 here, are concerned about the poor in

5 Taylor County. They don't know what's going on.

6 The elderly know, but some aren't able to get out

7 like me, but we're hard headed. And then there are

8 the children. I taught school for 37 years and I

9 loved every day of it. I've seen all kinds of

10 problems, but we don't need any more from that word

11 we've heard too many times, "pollution."

12 Okay. Okay. I read the article in

13 yesterday's Democrat. That's the first thing I do

14 in the morning, look to see if I'm in the

15 obituaries. If I'm not, then I do the next thing

16 you told me about, I start doing my breathing

17 exercises to see if I can still do that.

18 But anyway, being a child of the Depression,

19 we learned early when you leave a room, if you're

20 not going back in it in a few minutes, you turn the

21 light off. And I did that forever. And in recent

22 years, my grandchildren have taught me there's

23 plenty of it. Leave them on. Leave them on all

24 day. You've got money to pay for it.

25 But I think when I read your article about do

171

1 we need a coal plant and you mentioned

2 conservation, that's the first thing that ought to

3 come before we are where we are now. And it might

4 take two or three years before we really got into

5 it. And then I thought in the middle of the night,

6 no, the energy people wouldn't like that. If we

7 started an addition to the FCAT curriculum about

8 our shortage and need for electricity, and it's not

9 about money, it's about saving the earth. Okay.

10 Won't say any more there. We do need a lot more

11 talk about conservation. This -- as I've got my

12 speech written here, but I don't like it. A lot it

13 has been said.

14 When someone asked about the cancer rate, I

15 have a firsthand account of cancer in

16 Taylor County. In 1975, my precious World War II

17 husband, a Yankee -- incidentally I've done my part

18 for culture. I married a Yankee and brought him to

19 Perry County and then I married an Englishman and

20 brought him. That's all I'm doing.

21 Anyway, John woke up one morning and was

22 sitting on the side of the bed. I ran around to

23 that side. He had like an electric current coming

24 from his shoulder all the way down to his right

25 hand, it was. And in a few minutes, it stopped.

172

1 And I thought, well, has he had a stroke? So we

2 called Dr. Parker, met him at the hospital. And he

3 came out after he examined him and said it's not a

4 stroke. I said, well, what could it be? He said,

5 it could be brain cancer or a brain tumor. And

6 sent us to Tallahassee. And we spent two weeks

7 here for them to find out what was wrong.

8 And years later, I met Dr. Slade who was our

9 doctor. And he said I have never seen a strong man

10 so weak. And when I found out he was from

11 Taylor County, he said I have a lot of patients

12 down there who have brain cancer. Well, take it

13 for what it's worth. We don't know because we

14 haven't had any checking on all of that.

15 Let's see. Now, what else was I going to tell

16 you good people?

17 Affordability. I have just heard that

18 Tallahassee politicians will probably increase the

19 tax structure when they go with JEA and the carbon

20 tax comes in. Well, my sister and I have two

21 pieces of rental property we bought in the '30s

22 knowing that our teacher pension wouldn't provide

23 us with the kind of lifestyle we wanted.

24 MS. PERKINS: It wasn't in the '30s. The

25 '80s.

173

1 MS. KELYNACK: It was in the '80s. She keeps

2 me straight. You can see I'm losing it a little

3 bit. Anyway, we've had it 30 years and stays

4 rented. It's in a good location. And the taxes

5 keep going up. And I tell her, I said, we'd be

6 better to have our money in a CD.

7 But anyway, we are concerned about the rates

8 of electricity not going up too much because we've

9 made such a big deal about it being cheap when they

10 get into all of this. I can't understand how you

11 can figure out coal is cheaper than oil. I can

12 listen to my television, and I listen to the

13 business station, and for the last few months, it

14 seems like that oil is cheaper than coal. And I

15 know train stock. Because after I heard we were

16 going to get into this, I thought I'd buy me some.

17 And I know that train stock has gone up. So I

18 don't know how you figure the cost of things when

19 it's so cyclical. But maybe the ones smarter than

20 I am can figure that out.

21 Okay. I wrote notes while everybody was

22 talking this morning, but I suppose that's about

23 it. Appreciate you letting us come. I came to the

24 city commission and they didn't pay us too much

25 attention. They seemed to -- the majority seemed

174

1 to know all the right answers.

2 I am concerned about the democracy we find

3 ourselves living in. We know that all citizens

4 ought to be listened to and have a chance to know

5 what's going on. When you don't know until after

6 it happens and then everybody falls in with the

7 leaders and they begin to find out, that's not the

8 way it ought to be. It's almost too late to do

9 anything about it. We see this at the federal

10 level and of course at our local level. But

11 anyway, that's the way it is. And we'll have to

12 learn to live with it.

13 I do know one other thing I was going to tell

14 and I debated all night about whether to say it or

15 not. But we know special interest. And our

16 politicians have been involved in this. One of the

17 girls in our Sunday school class said her mother

18 always told her, if you mess with the devil, you

19 know who is going to win? The devil. Sometimes he

20 wins to teach the rest of us a lesson. And I'm not

21 going to tell you who I think the devil might be.

22 And my personal opinion is that this thing has

23 gone so far unless this commission sitting here,

24 unless you're brave souls and go against what's

25 coming to you like a freight train or a coal train,

175

1 we might have to pay for it later. Thank you.

2 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you.

3 Commissioner Carter?

4 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Ms. Kelynack, will you

5 sit for a moment, please?

6 MS. KELYNACK: Yes, yes.

7 COMMISSIONER CARTER: I mean, it would be a

8 shame for you to come all the way here at a

9 youthful 85 and we not say hello to you. I don't

10 think you're losing it at all. I think that you

11 are a refreshing breath of fresh air.

12 MS. KELYNACK: You're a sweet boy.

13 COMMISSIONER CARTER: I think you pretty much

14 covered the perspective about whether or not we

15 need the plant or not. I think that's a

16 perspective. I think you had a lot to say. We

17 thank for doing your bit to bring a Yankee down

18 here with us and then also repairing that thing we

19 had with the tea party a few years ago with

20 England.

21 MS. KELYNACK: I used to tell him when we'd go

22 anywhere, everybody would flock to him. And I

23 said, lord, they think you're an Englishman and I'm

24 telling them you're just putting on an act.

25 COMMISSIONER CARTER: Thank you so kindly.

176

1 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, ma'am.

2 MS. BRUBAKER: We do have some comments from

3 Ms. Kelynack. They should be identified as Item

4 No. 94 in our list.

5 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Yes.

6 (Exhibit No. 94 admitted into the record.)

7 MS. BRUBAKER: And the next speaker will be

8 Polly Perkins. Ms. Perkins is to be followed by

9 Betty Johnson.

10 MS. KELYNACK: That's my baby sister.

11 MS. BRUBAKER: To be followed by

12 Betty Johnson, Diane Whitfield and Pam McVety.

13 POLLY PERKINS

14 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

15 testified as follows:

16 DIRECT STATEMENT

17 MS. PERKINS: I don't have a lot to add. I'm

18 Polly Perkins, and I've lived in Perry for

19 82-and-a-half years. And I'm a retired school

20 teacher. And my sister and I share many things.

21 And I think she has said all that I need to say.

22 One thing I do want to mention is the

23 railroad. Crop -- the track crosses the main

24 street in Perry. Jefferson Street goes right in

25 front of the courthouse. And that's where the

177

1 train will cross about three blocks from the

2 courthouse unless they spend I don't know how much

3 money to move it somewhere else or do an overpass.

4 And I think that overpass would certainly be a bad

5 mistake.

6 Anyway, we have no power. All we have to do

7 is let people know that we don't want it. And

8 thank you for listening.

9 And I want to compliment you for being so

10 patient with all of us who have lots to say. We

11 used to have meetings -- well, the meetings we've

12 been to in Perry, the county commissioners had a

13 red, gold, green light. And sometimes I don't

14 think the person talking could even see the light.

15 But one rude county commissioner said, "Your time

16 is up." Wouldn't even let him finish the sentence.

17 I appreciate your patience and thank you so much.

18 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Ms. Perkins.

19 Thank you for coming to speak to us today.

20 Ms. Brubaker?

21 MS. BRUBAKER: Betty Johnson, please.

22 BETTY JOHNSON

23 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

24 testified as follows:

25 DIRECT STATEMENT

178

1 MS. JOHNSON: Thank you so much for allowing

2 so many wonderful people to come before you today.

3 I am Betty Johnson. I'm a resident, long life,

4 from Madison County. And my heart has gone out to

5 these people from Taylor County.

6 I think it was you, Commissioner Carter, who

7 said a community shares a community. Well, that's

8 what we became involved in, being from Madison

9 County to Taylor, and our hearts have gone out to

10 these folks.

11 In fact, I have submitted to you some record

12 evidence of special requests that I made to the

13 Florida attorney general and also to Jack Shreve,

14 senior general counsel. This request that I made

15 was also to Charlie Christ and also to Mr. Bill

16 McCollum.

17 I took a special interest in looking for what

18 was best to the citizens of the state of Florida

19 with regards to the proposed coal plant development

20 in Taylor County. And I thought about it a long,

21 long time. And I said, you know, it's really time

22 that the citizens of the state of Florida was

23 represented. And by that, I mean you will find in

24 my record that I have detailed pertinent facts

25 about this issue. They have been confirmed to me

179

1 by Mr. Jack Shreve, they are correct.

2 But he felt that I was so smart that I should

3 come down here and maybe represent this issue

4 myself. So please take a special interest in my

5 record that I submitted before you today. There

6 are some pertinent facts in here that you need to

7 be aware of.

8 Most of all, in the discussions that I've had

9 with these public officials is we all realize this

10 is a very serious decision that we need to make and

11 is it justified? Frankly, I ask that it simply be

12 denied because I find no justification at all.

13 The power is not needed in Taylor County and

14 is not needed in the regional area of any adjacent

15 county that is so severely impacted by the

16 pollution. And I don't know how many of you know

17 the geographic region that I'm talking about. But

18 Madison County, like most, and north-central

19 Florida, is a very beautiful rural community. And

20 we all know each other and we take great pride in

21 how much money the state has expended for

22 conservation of land and water resources along the

23 beautiful Suwannee River and all other tributaries

24 to that. You know, we've been blessed.

25 And for a coal plant to come in and totally

180

1 destroy our community, our environment is

2 unforgiving. So today I've asked simply that this

3 commission deny a need determination for

4 Taylor County Energy Center.

5 I will -- and I have listened today at other

6 testimony, I've taken some notes and I'll try to

7 briefly answer some of those concerns I have with

8 that testimony. I won't take up too much time. I

9 know we've been here for a long time today. And I

10 know you've been very patient and we appreciate --

11 we appreciate that, because we understand how

12 important this issue is and what it means to all of

13 us.

14 But in simple terms with my request to the

15 attorney general's and those up there with regards

16 to the citizens, I want you to know it's the

17 citizens of the state of Florida who are the

18 customers. We're for all state owned and leased

19 facilities. And I have spoken many, many times

20 with various public officials in the office of

21 energy here with DEP. We are diligently working to

22 seek alternative energy in Florida. And they

23 understand when I say no, we have to stop. We have

24 to cease the new development of coal-fired power

25 plants for Florida to do its share to stop our

181

1 global warming. And so they understand.

2 And believe you me, they have worked very,

3 very hard. They worked hard with the Legislature

4 last year. They're back in there again this year.

5 And folks, we need for you to understand there's

6 not a genuine need nor benefit for this coal plant

7 to be developed in north-central Florida. We are

8 sincere about that. There's no justification for

9 this to ever occur.

10 But in their site that they selected, please

11 allow me to expand just for a few moments on that.

12 You know, when we first heard about a utility

13 coming to north-central Florida regional area, we

14 heard they were out dealing with our development

15 authority and that they were looking for a site in

16 three counties. We heard Terrell, heard Madison,

17 and we heard Hamilton.

18 And then after a short time, we found out that

19 the site had been selected down in Taylor County

20 and it was 2,800 acres initially, and then it went

21 from there to I heard 3,200 acres. And I thought,

22 well, what's really behind this? Why was this site

23 selected? Because I know there's not a genuine

24 need. I know there's not a benefit. None of these

25 residents who were so impacted will get one ounce

182

1 of energy from that plant. Not one ounce.

2 So I asked that question of myself. And I

3 researched as much as I could find on why this site

4 was selected in Taylor County. And I came to one

5 conclusion. It seems that back around 1999 and

6 2000 and in 2001, in that frame of time, it seems

7 that there was discussion at the federal level

8 about regional transmission grids.

9 And it seems that C Trans had obtained an

10 order from the Federal Energy Regulatory

11 Commission. And those involved, the two bigger

12 utilities, was Southern Company and also Entergy

13 out of Louisiana. Involved in that was JEA, City

14 of Tallahassee, and as I recall, I believe FMPA.

15 And so I began to wonder why was this site

16 chosen in Taylor County when there was no genuine

17 need nor benefit. And there's only one substantial

18 reason as I can come to any conclusion, possibly in

19 the future we're going to be seeing C Trans. I

20 don't know of any other reason why that site would

21 have been chosen to serve the customers as I have

22 noted to you in my document elsewhere.

23 It's scary to think they could obtain an

24 application from you at the state level and then

25 create their regional transmission organization and

183

1 that the Public Service Commission after that fact

2 would have no control over what goes on. So I'm

3 going to leave that thought with you.

4 And I hope that you-all will be serious about

5 maybe pursuing that avenue a little bit more.

6 Because, I mean, if it ever got permitted without a

7 need or a benefit by you, then I'm going to caution

8 you and tell you that could possibly happen. And

9 as I remember from the federal studies that were

10 done on the three Florida grids, it was only C

11 Trans that would make a profit. I want to leave

12 that thought with you.

13 Also you've heard from an awful lot of local

14 residents from Taylor County talk about their local

15 public officials. Well, when there's money

16 dangling in somebody's face, it usually makes a

17 different opinion a lot of times. And I just want

18 you to know that there is a Website that anybody

19 can access to obtain any information about the coal

20 plant from the utility partners.

21 And if you'll go there, you will find that

22 there is $179 million to Taylor County. Now,

23 who -- who bears this cost? Will it be the

24 citizens of the state of Florida?

25 The impacts of the railroad, maybe I was the

184

1 Godchild of that. Let me tell you, Madison County

2 is going to be severely impacted. Madison County

3 has two existing rail lines, one of which runs

4 through the heart and core of every municipality in

5 Madison County. And we've talked about that a

6 great deal with our commission, both the city and

7 the county.

8 And so we know that if a permit is approved,

9 what we're going to be dealing with. And Madison

10 County right now is in the process of looking for a

11 new site for our new hospital. This is going to be

12 one of the issues that we are going to be looking

13 at, because Madison County only has one overpass or

14 bypass that goes over the rail line. So that's

15 going to be a crucial issue to us in choosing a

16 site that's suitable to meet our needs and any

17 emergency response that we may have and that would

18 apply in any other community. This should be part

19 of our planning on those issues.

20 DCA and I have touched base on that. They

21 understand the position that we're in. And if we

22 have to seek for federal money to bypass, in our

23 emergency situation, we're talking more dollars on

24 top of this particular development. But in my

25 opinion, you cannot separate out those two. When

185

1 you're talking about the impacts of the railroad

2 transportation issue for the coal shipments that

3 are necessary to this proposed power plant, you

4 cannot separate those two issues. It's all one

5 development any way you look at. You just don't

6 often realize all of the impacts that are

7 associated with that in that site that was

8 selected.

9 Finally, in closing, let me mention to you

10 briefly. I did review the case before you

11 recently, and I found record evidence of a public

12 notice that was published in the TACO newspaper in

13 Taylor County for this particular hearing today

14 before you.

15 I want the Commission to know that there has

16 been no other public notice to any adjacent county

17 with regard to any portion of this project. None.

18 But because I got so attached, I guess, to those

19 residents and my heart poured out to them, I took a

20 special interest as a resident from Madison County.

21 So I pretty well tried to stay abreast of

22 everything we need to know to deal with what's

23 coming for all of us regionally.

24 There's no way to separate. This is a

25 regional development that is certainly going to

186

1 impact many, many counties and municipalities. We

2 know that you understand that. We appreciate very

3 much your concern.

4 One other thing. Madison County long ago

5 learned a very valuable lesson. We promote only

6 clean industry in Madison County when someone comes

7 and makes an application to locate to Madison

8 County. I don't know how many of you remember a

9 few years back something called Waste Tech. It was

10 a regional hazardous waste incinerator that was to

11 locate in Madison County. It was to be there for

12 only 25 years. And after that, the problem was

13 Madison County and the state of Florida. We

14 learned a very valuable lesson. We spent four

15 years of our lives fighting with the state of

16 Florida's Waste Tech. I can't throw enough red

17 flags out there to others in other counties to

18 promote only clean industry. But believe you me,

19 we have to work hard at it every day to keep the

20 unclean out.

21 Finally, I will mention something also that I

22 saw recently in my research off of the NASA

23 Website. To my amazement, when I looked at what

24 appeared of record on that site, there were

25 pictures that showed prevailing winds off the coast

187

1 of Taylor County. And it talked about low

2 prevailing winds in an eastward direction. And

3 then it talked about high prevailing winds that

4 would prevail out over the coastline into the Gulf

5 of Mexico.

6 Can you imagine what is going to occur with so

7 much mercury? Do I need to remind you folks that

8 we have a public interest in the Big Bend sea grass

9 aquatic preserve as well as all of our public land

10 along the Suwannee River?

11 And finally I'd like to tell you that there

12 are more Florida freshwater springs found along

13 that Suwannee River than anywhere else in the

14 world, all contaminated when it's senseless and

15 useless to do it. So I urge you folks to deny the

16 need determination today for the Taylor Energy

17 Center and its participating utilities. Thank you.

18 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you. Mrs. Johnson, I'd

19 like to ask you, if you could a moment, a very

20 quick question. The document you've given us which

21 we will need to number in a moment, at the bottom

22 of page 3, I see that you've requested legal

23 representation on behalf of the citizens of Florida

24 in this proceeding and probably in other

25 proceedings –-

188

1 MS. JOHNSON: Yes, ma'am.

2 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: -- related to this same

3 proposal and application and that it was copied to

4 the Office of Public Counsel. Did you receive a

5 response to that request?

6 MS. JOHNSON: They preferred -- really and

7 truly, I did not get a response back from

8 Joe Jaquat with Bill McCollum. And the reason was

9 they have just gone through the transition. We

10 were in a bad time trying to seek some legal

11 representation for this particular case. You know,

12 we just kind of left it at that. We ran out of

13 time, you know.

14 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: There is a transition going

15 on.

16 MS. JOHNSON: I know.

17 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: But I do know at the very

18 bottom of page 4, you do have it copied to

19 Mr. Harold McLean with the Office of Public

20 Counsel. The Office of Public Counsel is part of

21 the Legislature. So that office would not be as

22 directly impacted by the transitioning in the

23 executive branch and they are charged with

24 representing consumers.

25 MS. JOHNSON: Right. But I had raised an

189

1 issue on it, if I could, Chairman, before -- prior

2 to that with our legislative delegation which was

3 Lawson, Kendricks and Argenziano for our area, and

4 I flat told them, you folks listen to me closely.

5 We've got a coal plant proposed in Taylor County

6 and I want you guys to know, we have a -- you have

7 a dog in this fight too when it comes to the state

8 protecting our public interest. And so they know

9 where I'm coming from. You know, they have a

10 responsibility to protect our public interest. So

11 they knew where I was coming from when I made those

12 statements, you know?

13 One thing I did fail to make mention of is

14 that in 2005 when I heard about this, I did address

15 that in a town hall meeting, this coal plant issue,

16 with U.S. Senator Bill Nelson and respectively

17 requested suspension of all federal money for this

18 project because there was no genuine need nor

19 benefit existing to develop this project in Taylor

20 County.

21 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you.

22 MS. JOHNSON: Questions or maybe comments?

23 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: We need to go ahead and mark

24 the documents.

25 MS. BRUBAKER: Actually we have received

190

1 comments from Ms. Perkins who testified before

2 Ms. Johnson. If we can have that item marked as

3 Exhibit No. 95. And if we could mark Ms. Johnson's

4 comments as Exhibit 96, please.

5 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Okay. So marked.

6 (Exhibits No. 95 and 96 admitted into the

7 record.)

8 MS. BRUBAKER: Thank you.

9 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Ms. Johnson.

10 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you so much.

11 MS. BRUBAKER: The next speaker is

12 Diane Whitfield, please.

13 DIANE WHITFIELD

14 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

15 testified as follows:

16 DIRECT STATEMENT

17 MS. WHITFIELD: Hello commissioners, my name

18 is Diane Whitfield. I live at 6740-A Whitfield

19 Lane in Taylor County, ten miles southwest from the

20 center of Perry on 89 acres. I've been interested

21 in the coal plant results for a long time. But

22 when I heard in early '05 that they were

23 considering siting the plant on the west -- on the

24 acreage to the west of our west fence, I became

25 very interested. Because, you know, just like the

191

1 Tallahassee city commission didn't want a coal

2 plant in their backyard, I didn't want it next to

3 my west fence in sight of my property either. I

4 understand Madison County didn't want it in their

5 backyard and Wakulla County took steps not to have

6 it in their backyard.

7 I welcome the opportunity to speak before you

8 today. I know that you have knowledge and training

9 in economics, and that therefore the decisions you

10 make guarantee a consideration of relevant economic

11 theory. It must be daunting to some members of the

12 public to speak in front of an audience of all of

13 these suits and business people and the legal staff

14 because that's not typically who some of us hang

15 out with.

16 But I'm convinced that the public does

17 represent citizens with extensive training and

18 experience in the area of cost external to the

19 calculations that the four applicants are

20 presenting. I know that direct costs of mining

21 coal, transporting coal, building power plants and

22 transmission lines are obvious costs and are paid

23 by the producers and the consumers of the energy.

24 Just as valid are the indirect costs of

25 diminished health due to air pollution from coal

192

1 plant, burning coal, cost of damage to land and

2 lungs from mining coal, cost of damage to forests

3 and the cost to our future quality of life as the

4 atmosphere is altered. I learned there's a name

5 for these kinds of costs, and I've heard it today.

6 I've been a social worker all my life, not an

7 economist, so I didn't know there was such a thing

8 as externalities. But I studied up on that early

9 this morning when I woke up to get ready for today.

10 That's why I'm as tired as I can be. I wonder if

11 everybody else here is exhausted. Five o'clock was

12 too early to get up and learn about externalities.

13 At any rate, I feel like an expert on negative

14 externalities of a different sort having spent

15 34 years as a trained social worker in rural

16 Taylor County. I've witnessed and attempted to

17 resolve the results of public policy that were

18 negative externalities. I'm here today to

19 encourage you to consider those as equally valid

20 and more global, no pun intended there, than the

21 issues listed on the material I received about

22 today's proceedings.

23 As a resident of the community in which this

24 plant desires to be sited, I wanted to intervene in

25 the proceedings but was not allowed to; however, I

193

1 was invited to come as an interested party and sent

2 the information which I find fascinating. You

3 know, it's just all good reading.

4 My electric provider, though -- I wrote to

5 Seminole Electric. I receive energy from

6 Tri-county in Perry and they get their power from

7 Seminole. I wrote to them and asked the general

8 manager if they had ever purchased power to FMPA or

9 JEA, and they said yes. So I am a consumer once

10 removed, you know.

11 I've learned a great deal about conservation

12 and efficiency from watching the documentary,

13 Kilowatt Hours. I hope everyone here watches it.

14 I've reduced my family's consumption of electric to

15 below 500 kilowatt hours per month on average. One

16 month in the last month it went to 600 and

17 something. We did run our -- we never had air

18 conditioning, but we have a new air conditioner,

19 two years old, and we got one of those high SEER

20 energy efficient ones. And we ran it all during --

21 what were the hot months? June, July -- July,

22 August. We ran it for two months and still my

23 energy wasn't far over 600-kilowatt hours. We have

24 a 1,600 something square foot house.

25 At any rate, I also checked with Tallahassee.

194

1 I think I asked Mr. Wales a year ago, two years

2 ago, when I heard that Tallahassee had attempted

3 some demand side management and had some programs,

4 he said but they weren't successful because people

5 didn't participate. And I heard that earlier today

6 from the FMPA man that was here.

7 And I thought about that later when I saw the

8 tremendous drive that went on, the money spent, the

9 advertising, the visits, the open houses that were

10 held when they wanted the vote to pass about

11 keeping Tallahassee in the partnership. Well,

12 Mr. Wales said -- I said, did you market it? Did

13 you tell people about this great opportunity that

14 the City of Tallahassee had? He said, we don't

15 have money for that. We don't have a budget for

16 marketing. We're just a city.

17 And I thought -- later I thought, wait a

18 minute, where did they get the money for the glossy

19 ads and where did they get the money for selling

20 the boat idea? But anyway, that was puzzling to

21 me.

22 I think anything has to be sold. And if

23 people don't participate -- I notice when voters

24 aren't sure about how to vote, it's phrased

25 differently or reframed and you say it a different

195

1 way so that people like the idea better. Well, you

2 sell your idea.

3 And so the FMPA folks that have all of those

4 communities -- I counted that they have like 27 or

5 29 communities, but maybe that's a grouping of 15

6 major places that get power from them. If they've

7 actively sold and lobbied and tried to get the

8 customers to participate in demand side management,

9 well, that's good. I'd like to know that.

10 I'd like -- I called Ray Maxwell with Reedy

11 Creek and I said, Mr. Maxwell, since I don't want

12 this power plant in my backyard, why don't you put

13 it on all the land you own down there by Disney

14 World and you can show people how you can make a

15 great plant. And then the children coming to

16 Disney World would think, whoa, the mouse is a

17 really good thing.

18 He said, water, Ms. Whitfield. We can't put

19 it here because we don't have enough water in

20 Orange County. What do you think I thought about

21 that? I thought, oh, Taylor County does.

22 I really am concerned and tried to reach out

23 to other people. Demand side management is a very

24 good thing. My husband is a quiet man. He's been

25 reading the Weather Maker book. He's reading it

196

1 now for the second time which means a lot to me.

2 He's a very slow reader. So he finally finished

3 it, took it back to the library and then bought a

4 copy. He's reading it again and he was

5 philosophizing with me. And I promised I would

6 bring his question but I don't want it to offend

7 you.

8 He talks like this. He said, "Diane, when

9 madmen practice the annihilation of entire

10 populations, we call it genocide. When we go

11 forward and ignore available scientific evidence

12 concerning extinction, drought, extreme weather,

13 what do we call that?"

14 In conclusion, I request that you deny

15 approval of this and any other application

16 submitted for a coal-burning power plant until your

17 need analysis includes the cost of the negative

18 externalities that we've heard discussed today.

19 Thank you.

20 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Ms. Whitfield.

21 MS. WHITFIELD: The only thing I have to give

22 you, an elderly woman in Perry, I found this in my

23 office yesterday -- by the way, I wonder if anybody

24 here is being paid to be here? You reckon? Some

25 of these -- some of us took leave without pay

197

1 because we've used up all of our leave doing these

2 meetings. And I wonder if there are people here

3 that are actually paid to be here.

4 Not you guys. I know you guys are probably --

5 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: For some of us, this is part

6 of our job and this is why we like our job, because

7 we --

8 MS. WHITFIELD: I like my job too and don't

9 tell the superintendent I'm taking all this time

10 off.

11 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Ms. Whitfield, thank you for

12 your comments and thank you for coming today.

13 Would you like to give a document to our staff,

14 please?

15 MS. WHITFIELD: It's for the lady in Perry.

16 Can I do that? She left it on my chair to give it

17 to you, her comments.

18 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: We'll ask Mr. Breman to take

19 that from you.

20 Thank you, Mr. Breman. And we will need to

21 mark it. I meant 97.

22 MS. BRUBAKER: That's correct.

23 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: So Exhibit 97 will have been

24 submitted with Ms. Whitfield.

25 MS. BROWNLESS: Do you have a title?

198

1 MS. BRUBAKER: The next speaker is --

2 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Hold on. I missed who was

3 talking to me. Just a moment.

4 Ms. Brownless, was that you? I apologize.

5 MS. BROWNLESS: That's all right. I was just

6 wondering what is the name of that document so

7 we --

8 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: We have been -- Ms. Brubaker,

9 you can help me out here.

10 We have been -- I have been, let me do it that

11 way, and Ms. Brubaker is keeping the official

12 record with the court reporter but marking the

13 numbers to correspond with the documents to

14 correspond with the witness who has given them to

15 us.

16 MS. BRUBAKER: That's correct. We've been

17 identifying them with the witness' name just for

18 ease of identity.

19 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Trying to bring in some

20 simplicity and also to give clarity.

21 MS. BROWNLESS: Yes, ma'am. But this is not

22 Ms. Whitfield's statement.

23 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: No, it is not. But it is

24 submitted by her. That is my understanding.

25 MS. BROWNLESS: Thank you.

199

1 (Exhibit No. 97 admitted into the record.)

2 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Okay. Ms. McVety, welcome.

3 PAM MCVETY

4 was called as a witness and, having been duly sworn,

5 testified as follows:

6 DIRECT STATEMENT

7 MS. McVETY: Thank you. And good afternoon,

8 Madam Chairman and Commissioners.

9 My name is Pam McVety, and I am here today as

10 a citizen, but I also am a member of the Big Bend

11 Climate Action Team. And I do volunteer work for

12 the Presbyterian Church U.S.A. on climate change

13 and energy issues. And as a scientist, I've been

14 studying and tracking climate change science since

15 2000.

16 I would like to make two points today

17 regarding the cost of burning coal. The first

18 point is that the estimated cost of compliance with

19 carbon emission regulations will soon have to be

20 updated to reflect the current science in

21 congressional legislation. Once this cost is

22 reestimated, the Taylor County -- the Taylor Energy

23 Center will prove, I believe, not to be

24 cost-effective.

25 In the 109th congressional session, 20 bills

200

1 were introduced that dealt with reducing our carbon

2 emissions. And from the science, it's clear that

3 large cuts are going to have to be made between now

4 and the year 2050, cuts on the order of 60 to

5 80 percent to avoid dangerous runaway climate

6 change.

7 The Global Warming Reduction Act, Senate Bill

8 4039 already requires those kinds of very large

9 reductions. Thus it is not unrealistic to project

10 that legislation requiring these kinds of carbon

11 emission reductions will pass given the serious and

12 urgent nature or need to respond to the escalating

13 impacts of climate change.

14 I would also like to commend to you the

15 document that was put into the record earlier by

16 Kent Miller. This is the document by the union of

17 concerned scientists. It's entitled Gambling with

18 Coal, How Future Climate Laws Will Make New Coal

19 Power Plants More Expensive. This is an

20 outstanding document.

21 My second point -- my second point is that

22 large external costs are now known to be associated

23 with the impacts of releasing more carbon dioxide

24 into the atmosphere. These impacts are so serious

25 that they are already costing each of us more than

201

1 any possible savings on our monthly utility bills

2 associated with burning coal.

3 And I offer the example of weather related

4 disasters and the resulting property insurance

5 crisis. Rising economic losses due to

6 weather-related disasters are linked to climate

7 change. Two research papers were published in 2005

8 linking our warming oceans with increased

9 frequency, duration and intensity of storms

10 worldwide. And I have the references for the

11 record in my talk which I'll hand in.

12 According to the National Climatic Data Center

13 at NOAA, Florida has had more

14 billion-dollar-related disasters than any other

15 state in the nation. This was during the period of

16 1980 to 2005. So as a result, Florida is in the

17 midst of a property insurance crisis. Hindsight

18 will show that escalating insurance rates are

19 directly related to our warming of the land and

20 water and that no true lasting solution can be

21 achieved until the underlying cause, carbon output,

22 is addressed.

23 An insurance specialist with Aviva, the fifth

24 large insurance company in the world, reports that

25 insurance losses because of extreme weather are

202

1 going up 10 percent a year while economic growth is

2 only averaging 3 percent per year. He reports that

3 by 2065 the two growth curves will intersect and

4 the world economy will no longer be able to sustain

5 these losses.

6 These are just two very brief examples of the

7 very real and rising costs associated with carbon

8 emissions. Coal-fired power plants incur costs

9 that the Public Service Commission hadn't

10 traditionally considered. But it is clear to me

11 that a coal-fired power plant would cost me much

12 more than what my monthly utility bill would show.

13 Please consider these costs when determining

14 whether we can afford a coal plant.

15 Thank you for the opportunity to speak. Thank

16 you for the generous amount of time and attention

17 you're giving to hearing our concerns.

18 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: Thank you, Ms. McVety. And

19 I'll note that the document that was submitted

20 earlier that you brought to our additional

21 attention was marked as No. 88. And if you will

22 give your comments to our staff over there, we will

23 mark those as well.

24 MS. BRUBAKER: And those would be marked as

25 Item 98, is that correct, by your list?

203

1 CHAIRMAN EDGAR: That's where I'm at too.

2 (Exhibit No. 98 admitted into the record.)

3 (Please go to Volume 3.)

4 \* \* \*

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

204

1 CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

2

3

4

5 STATE OF FLORIDA )

6 COUNTY OF LEON )

7

8 I, LORI DEZELL, RPR, CCR, certify that I was

9 authorized to and did stenographically report the

10 proceedings herein, and that the transcript is a true

11 and complete record of my stenographic notes.

12 I further certify that I am not a relative,

13 employee, attorney or counsel of any of the parties, nor

14 am I a relative or employee of any of the parties'

15 attorney or counsel connected with the action, nor am I

16 financially interested in the action.

17 WITNESS my hand and official seal this 11th

18 day of January, 2007.

19

20

21 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

22 LORI DEZELL, RPR, CCR

2894-A Remington Green Lane

23 Tallahassee, Florida 32308

850-878-2221

24

25