FEDACTED FI

**DOCKET 060763-TL** FILED: FEBRUARY 6, 2007

## 1 Embarg's NPV of Cash Flows 2 3 Q. Starting at page 26 of his testimony Mr. Wood begins a series of Q&As pertaining to the NPV of cash flows analysis presented in your direct testimony. Do you agree 4 with Mr. Wood's criticisms and conclusions? 5 6 7 Of course I do not, but more importantly I can easily explain why Mr. Wood is A. 8 incorrect. Looking first at Mr. Wood's criticisms regarding Embarq's \(\bigwidegredge \)% voice service 9 penetration projection at page 26 of his testimony, he complains that Embarg's market share data analysis does not ensure "...the "right" answer for the Treviso Bay area will 10 be %". 11 12 Embarq agrees that this estimate might not prove to be precisely the "right" answer 13 given it is projection of a future outcome (which Embarq hopes to never suffer). It is 14 15 extremely telling however, that market penetrations provided in the "Embarq – Florida Market Share Analysis Summer 2006" 16 17

table (see Embarq response to Staff Date Request 3) ! Thus it is not necessary, or even advisable to identify what the exact penetration of Embarg's voice only services might be, absent the requested COLR relief, result in negative, and harmful economic losses to Embarg. Obviously Embarq is convinced of this negative result, or it would have gladly gone forward with

18

19

20

21

22

23

11229 FEB-65

the construction and operation of a profitable network in Treviso Base UMENE NUMBER - DATE

## EMBARQ FLORIDA, INC. DOCKET 060763-TL

FILED: FEBRUARY 6, 2007

2	Q.	On page 32, line 21, Mr. Wood claims that Embarq's NPV of cash flows analysis is
3		"suspect" because it produces a negative NPV at year 10 using a 100% penetration
4		assumption. Is Mr. Wood's conclusion correct?
5	A.	Not at all. Mr. Wood's testimony indicates his apparent lack of understanding of the
6		general realities of a wireline carrier's financial returns for serving residential customer
7		markets.
8		
9		First, Mr. Wood conveniently does not mention that his hypothetical 100% penetration
10		NPV run produces a positive result somewhere between year
11		
12		
13		
14		Second, Mr. Wood makes further erroneous claims that this year NPV payback
15		period exceeds the useful life of the underlying assets. In reality, the bulk of these fiber
16		and copper cable assets, when deployed in markets sufficiently open to competition,
17		will be economically and physically useful well beyond well years. Mr. Wood also
18		ignores that Comcast's 100% bulk contract of high speed data and video results in no
19		revenue or cash generation for Embarq from these services, which further explains why
20		the NPV payback period falls between years.
21		
22	Q.	Are there other errors evidenced in Mr. Wood's calculations?
23	A.	Yes, several. Mr. Wood claims that customer density of the Treviso Bay development is

1