Ruth Nettles

From:

Kelley, Gerri [Gerri.Kelley@dgslaw.com]

Sent:

Friday, February 05, 2010 12:23 PM

To:

Filings@psc.state.fl.us

Cc:

Denman, Steve

Subject:

Response to AT&T's Notice of Non-Party's Objection to Subpoena Duces Tecum

Attachments: Response to AT&T's Notice of Non-Party's Objection to Subpoena Duces Tecum.pdf

Person Filing: Steven H. Denman, Florida Bar No. 0191732

Davis Graham & Stubbs LLP

9040 Town Center Parkway, Suite 213

Lakewood Ranch, FL 34202

941-487-3657

941-552-5650 (facsimile) Steve.Denman@dgslaw.com

Docket No.:

090538-TP

Filed on behalf of:

Qwest Communications Company, LLC

Total number of pages:

6

Brief description:

Response to AT&T's Notice of Non-Party's Objection to Subpoena Duces Tecum

BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF FLORIDA

In re: Complaint of Qwest Communications Company, LLC against MCImetro Access Transmission Services (d/b/a Verizon Access Transmission Services); XO Communications Services, Inc.; tw telecom of florida, l.p.; Granite Telecommunications, LLC; Cox Florida Telcom, L.P.; Broadwing Communications, LLC; and John Does 1 through 50 (CLEC's whose true names are currently unknown) for rate discrimination in connection with the provision of intrastate switched access services in alleged violation of Sections 364.08 and 364.10, F.S.

Docket No. 090538-TP

Filed: February 5, 2010

RESPONSE TO AT&T'S NOTICE OF NON-PARTY'S OBJECTION TO SUBPOENA DUCES TECUM

Pursuant to Rules 1.351(c) and 1.351(d), Florida Rules of Civil Procedure, Qwest Communications Company, LLC ("Qwest"), by and through its counsel, herewith files its Response to the Notice of Non-Party's Objection to Subpoena Duces Tecum filed on January 29, 2010 by AT&T Inc. (via special appearance), AT&T Corp. (via special appearance), and AT&T Communications of the Southern States, LLC ("AT&T"). Pursuant to an agreement with AT&T, discussed in detail *infra*, Qwest respectfully requests that the Florida Public Service Commission ("Commission") hold the relief requested in AT&T's filed objections to the subpoena duces tecum (the "Subpoena") in abeyance while the companies confer regarding any differences in position regarding the Subpoena; that Qwest need not respond to the substance of AT&T's objections at this time; and that the Presiding Officer (or the Commission) need not rule on AT&T's objections unless and until Qwest and AT&T reach an impasse. In support of this Motion, Qwest states as follows:

00823 FEB-5 €

954349.1

- 1. On or about January 15, 2010, Qwest served the Subpoena on the registered agent for AT&T in Florida. The Subpoena requested production of certain agreements and other documents needed by Qwest for the prosecution of the instant Complaint.
- 2. On January 29, 2010 AT&T filed its Notice of Non-Party's Objection to Subpoena Duces Tecum, raising a number of substantive objections to the Commission's personal jurisdiction and to the Subpoena. In its prayer for relief, AT&T requested that the Commission enter an order sustaining its objections or, if not sustaining the objections, limiting the scope of the Subpoena and other matters *inter alia* related to confidentiality protection, cost and due date for production of the requested documents.
- 3. In Paragraph 6 of its Notice, AT&T stated: "Notwithstanding the above, AT&T is in good-faith attempting to resolve the above objections with Qwest." Pursuant to those discussions between in-house counsel Mr. Brian Moore for AT&T and Mr. Adam Sherr for Qwest the two companies reached the following agreement: that the Presiding Officer (or Commission) hold the relief requested in AT&T's filed objections to the Subpoena in abeyance while the companies confer regarding any differences in position regarding the Subpoena; that the matter of AT&T's objections to the Subpoena should be held in abeyance; that Qwest need not respond to the substance of AT&T's objections at this time; and that the Presiding Officer (or the Commission) need not rule on AT&T's objections unless and until Qwest and AT&T reach an impasse.
- 4. Qwest has been authorized by AT&T to represent in this Response that AT&T agrees that the matter of its objections to the Subpoena should be held in abeyance, that Qwest need not respond to the substance of AT&T's objections at this time, and that the Presiding

Officer (or the Commission) need not rule on AT&T's objections unless and until Qwest and AT&T reach an impasse.

- 5. Qwest also suggests that, in its order on the Notice and this Response, the Presiding Officer (or Commission) find that in the event that Qwest and AT&T do reach an impasse over the production of the requested documents, they will so advise the Commission in a written notice and Qwest will file its substantive response seven (7) days after the filing of the notice of reaching an impasse.
- 6. No prejudice to any party to this complaint will result from the disposition of the Notice and this Response in the manner agreed to between Qwest and AT&T.

WHEREFORE, Qwest respectfully requests that the Commission enter an order finding: that the Presiding Officer (or Commission) hold the relief requested in AT&T's filed objections to the Subpoena in abeyance while the companies confer regarding any differences in position and regarding the Subpoena; that the matter of AT&T's objections to the Subpoena should be held in abeyance; that Qwest need not respond to the substance of AT&T's objections at this time; and that the Presiding Officer (or the Commission) need not rule on AT&T's objections unless and until Qwest and AT&T reach an impasse. The order should also provide that, in the event that Qwest and AT&T do reach an impasse over the production of the requested documents, Qwest and AT&T so advise the Commission in a written notice and Qwest will file its substantive response seven (7) days after the filing of the notice of reaching an impasse.

DATED this 5th day of February 2010.

s/Steven H. Denman

Steven H. Denman, Florida Bar No. 0191732 Davis Graham & Stubbs LLP 9040 Town Center Parkway, Suite 213 Lakewood Ranch, FL 34202 941-487-3657 941-552-5650 (facsimile) Steve.Denman@dgslaw.com

and

Alex M. Duarte (not admitted in Florida) Corporate Counsel Qwest 421 SW Oak Street Room 810 Portland, OR 97204

Tel: 503-242-5623 Fax: 503-242-8589

Email: Alex.Duarte@qwest.com

Adam L. Sherr (not admitted in Florida) Corporate Counsel Qwest 1600 7th Avenue, Room 1506 Seattle, WA 98191 Tel: 206-398-2507

Fax: 206-343-4040

Email: Adam.Sherr@qwest.com

Attorneys for Qwest Communications Company, LLC

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a copy of the forgoing Response to At&T's Notice of Non-Party's Objection to Subpoena Duces Tecum has been furnished by U.S. Mail and email to the following this 5th day of February 2010:

MCImetro Access Transmission Services dba Verizon Access Transmission Services: Dulaney O'Roarke, Esq. Verizon Six Concourse Parkway, NE - Suite 800 Atlanta, GA 30328 de.oroark@verizon.com

Granite Telecommunications, LLC:
Andrew M. Klein, Esq.
Allen Zoracki, Esq.
Klein Law Group PLLC
1250 Connecticut Ave., N.W., Ste. 200
Washington DC 20036
aklein@kleinlawpllc.com
azoracki@kleinlawpllc.com

Broadwing Communications, LLC: Gregory Diamond, Esq. Broadwing Communications, LLC 1025 Eldorado Blvd. Broomfield, CO 80021 greg.diamond@level3.com Qwest Communications Company, LLC: Alex M. Duarte, Esq. Qwest Communications Company, LLC 421 SW Oak Street, Rm. 810 Portland, OR 97204 alex.duarte@qwest.com

Qwest Communications Company, LLC: Adam L. Scherr Qwest Communications Company, LLC 1600 7th Avenue, Rm. 1506 Seattle, WA 98191 adam.sherr@qwest.com

tw telecom of florida l.p.
Gene Adams, Esq.
Pennington, Moore, Wilkinson, Bell & Dunbar
215 South Monroe Street, 2nd Floor
Tallahassee, FL 32301
gene@penningtonlawfirm.com

Broadwing Communications, LLC:
Marsha E. Rule, Esq.
Rutledge, Ecenia & Purnell
P.O. Box 551
Tallahassee, FL 32302-0551
marsha@reuphlaw.com

Cox Communications and XO Communications Services Inc.: Beth Keating, Esq.
Matthew Feil, Esq.
Akerman Senterfitt
Highpoint Center, 12th Floor 106 East College Avenue
Tallahassee, FL 32301
beth.keating@akerman.com
matthew.feil@akerman.com

XO Communications Services, Inc. Gregory J. Kopta Davis Wright Tremaine LLP 1201 Third Ave., Ste. 2200 Seattle, WA 98101

AT&T Inc., AT&T Corp., AT&T
Communications of the Southern States, LLC
Manuel A. Gurdian
c/o Gregory R. Follensbee
150 South Monroe Street, Suite 400
Tallahassee, FL 32301
manuel.gurdian@att.com

Sprint Communications Company Limited Partnership, and SprintCom, Inc.
Douglas C. Nelson, Esq.
233 Peachtree Street NE, Suite 2200
Atlanta, GA 30339-3166
douglas.c.nelson@sprint.com

/s Geraldine Kelley